Translating Communities
Issue 4 (2018)

About the Issue

The topic of Issue 4 of Spark is translating communities. This theme concerns the way in which one community, be it linguistic, cultural, or academic, communicates with others. Translation, then, does not just concern the transformation of one language into another, but also how bodies of knowledge, learning strategies, cultures, and identities are shared with the world. To this end, the articles in this issue address these techniques. Sue Rawcliffe, in 'Imagining the Past, Imagining the Future: Communities and Social Welfare in the West of Scotland', looks at how imagination and memory, crossed with archival records and stories about events within two communities situated in the West of Scotland, might help to develop perceptions of these communities' futures. Charlotte McPherson, Samantha Punch, and Elizabeth Graham, in 'Postgraduate Transitions from Masters to Doctoral Study: Managing Independence, Emotions, and Support', explore the significantly overlooked area of student transition in Higher Education from Masters to Doctoral study. They find the process a complex, demanding, and emotional one for students, who must engage in a translation of their academic selves, research, and critical thinking to meet the needs of their doctoral research communities. Aileen Lobban, in 'Louise Bennett: On Writing the Creole Community, Poetically', analyses how Bennett engages in a gendered Jamaican identity through the dub poet's poems, identifying her community through Jamaican Creole and Jamaican proverbs to help push it beyond colonialism and patriarchal hegemony – a translation that is linguistic, socio-cultural, and national. Kelly Gardner reviews *Contemporary Spanish Gothic* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2016), by Ann Davies.

Contents

Imagining the past, imagining the future:
Communities and Social Welfare in the West of Scotland

Sue Rawcliffe

University of Strathclyde, sue.rawcliffe@strath.ac.uk

Abstract: This paper is about imagining. The imagination involved in historical research to develop two original accounts of community-based activities in the West of Scotland and the imagination of members of community organisations as they engage with these accounts. This engagement involves the interaction of memory with archival records, myths and story in a process of constructing the past and considering what, if anything, it might offer to contemporary communities as they imagine their futures. The paper is also about the imagining involved in ideas of community, that 'much maligned and yet highly resilient concept' (Crow 2014: 374) and in the aspirations for the role that communities might play in relation to social welfare. This turn to community can be seen particularly at times of transformation and flux and is currently evident in the Scottish Government's approach. The paper draws on historical research into activities at particular points in time within two communities in the West of Scotland where it has been possible to build links with local community organisations to consider their contemporary relevance. The community organisations are the Tannahill Centre in Ferguslie Park, Paisley and the Kinning Park Complex in Glasgow.

Introduction

Despite being a source of endless interest and debate, local communities and their activities are not well represented in the historical literature. This is particularly the case for disadvantaged communities whose members often leave scant historical records. These are the very communities that are the focus of social policy interest and prescriptions but often have limited historical perspectives to draw on. Communities are at the centre of current Scottish Government policy-making, particularly in its key areas of responsibility which are in the areas of social policy (Mooney and Scott 2011). They are seen to be key to the transformation of public services which following the recommendations of the Christie Commission will be 'built around people and communities, their needs, aspirations, capacities and skills and work to build up their autonomy and resilience' (Commission on the Future Delivery of Public Services 2011). They will be supported to ensure that all their members can contribute their energy, creativity and talents to a 'flourishing and fairer Scotland' and the benefits anticipated from the recent Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015 include a boost in democratic participation, higher numbers of people volunteering and more satisfaction with the quality of life in local neighbourhoods (www.scot.gov.uk).

The history of social policy over the past 150 years would suggest that while this represents a new legislative framework and includes some new policy and practice approaches, the impetus behind these current developments is not entirely new or indeed transformational. There is a long-standing link between ideas of community and social welfare that is evident in the range of organisations, initiatives and experiments which have characterised the 'mixed economy of welfare' (Finlayson 1994: 6) and the 'moving frontier' between the different elements of a system in which communities and their organisations have always played an important part.

Background

The study is located in interdisciplinary and contested territory and draws on material from history, sociology, social work studies, social policy and community development. Key concepts are those of 'community' and 'public history', both of which have given rise to a considerable body of literature.

6   Imagining the past, imagining the future

In their research report for the Connected Communities programme Crow and Mah (2011:) identified 100 works that related to the theme of 'conceptualisations and meanings of "community": the theory and operationalization of a contested concept' that had been produced since 2000. While Williams (1976: 66) remains a key reference point, 'that warmly persuasive word', that 'seems never to be used unfavourably' they suggest that recent conceptualisations of community are more paradoxical:

> the term is used positively to represent social belonging, collective well-being, solidarity and support, but also negatively in relation to social problems and 'problem populations' (Crow and Mah 2011: 4).

Current approaches suggest a fluid, open notion of community based on the range of different identities and associations individuals can develop across time and space in a globalised world. Community is thus emergent, about communication, and constructed by social action and 'a set of practices that constitute belonging' (Delanty 2003: 130). Somerville (2016: 17) argues that while as a concept it remains highly ambiguous and contested, 'its value lies in its core meaning as social attachments, bonds, ties or obligations beyond the family'. It is in notions of well- being, support and mutual obligation beyond the family that ideas of community and social welfare can be seen to connect.

Indeed, these are often seen in attempts to recover community lost or attempts to build new forms of community. Bauman (2001) suggests the impetus for this is a search for security in our currently insecure world. The security we long for and seek in community, he suggests comes at the price of freedom and individuality. Notions of community are at best nostalgic and illusory and will always fail to deliver:

> Paradise lost or a paradise still hoped to be found: one way or another, this is definitely not a paradise that we inhabit and not the paradise that we know from our own experience. (Bauman 2001: 3)

If community is beyond our reach it is in the realm of imagination, of our aspirations and community becomes a powerful impetus to change:

> If there is to be a community in the world of individuals, it can only be (and needs to be) a community woven together from sharing and mutual care: a community of concern and responsibility for the equal right to be human and the equal ability to act on that right (ibid: 149).

The extent to which such change can be informed by historical perspectives is of interest here and leads to ideas of 'public history'. At a general level these are concerned with new participants in the history making process, with new areas of interest and drawing on non- traditional materials. They might also as Newell suggests involving a different 'attitude or perception about the use and value of history' (quoted Kean and Martin 2013: xvi). While an early focus of public history was on where it was being produced, by whom and how it was transmitted by historians to the 'public', Kean (2010: 26) argues for 'a different way of thinking about public history that places less emphasis on any distinctiveness of "historian" and "public" and more upon the process of how the past becomes history' and the 'form and processes involved in the creation of history' (ibid: 29).

History in this public sense can be a collective and collaborative activity in which all can engage as active agents (Ashton and Kean 2008). It is no longer the preserve of academic historians and there is a long tradition of alternative histories developed outside the academy. Drawing on Samuel's (1994: 8) legacy and his oft-quoted definition of history as 'a form of social knowledge; the work in a given instance of a thousand different hands', they argue for inclusive histories. These are histories which break down knowledge barriers, value engagement and promote the use of different materials. Such ideas can be seen to have informed the development of the new social histories, the identity histories and oral histories of respectively the 1960s, 1970s and 1980s (Flinn 2011).

While such histories expand the range and scope of historical perspectives, concerns have been expressed about the dangers of a focus on rediscovery and essentially local concerns. As applied to work in communities and independent and community archives, Flinn (2011) highlights the danger of a focus on 'reclamation and celebration' and the development of community archives as places of passive collection of the past. This can be addressed, he suggests, by the inclusion of elements of critical reflection and analysis which create the possibility of a radical or oppositional history that can 'become a significant tool for discovery, education and empowerment' (ibid: 9). This, he claims will be a source of 'useful' history, history not produced solely for academic purposes, but histories 'that are explicitly intended to be used to support the achievement of political objectives and mobilization as a means of inspiring action and cementing solidarity' (ibid: 12). Tosh (2014) equally expresses concern that public history might become solely concerned with questions of locality and identity. To avoid this and to ensure that it is 'critical' and 'democratically attuned', he argues, it may continue to need the services of professional historians to provide access to the wider information and critical perspective that they can bring to questions of public interest, 'which not only go beyond what is currently under discussion but also serve as a critique of the received wisdom' (Tosh 2014: 197).

The historical research on which this paper is based would fit an essentially academic model of history, drawing on secondary and archival sources and, in the case of Paisley Community Development project, some witness testimonies to produce detailed original accounts of which only the briefest outline can be provided here. Archival sources consulted included Glasgow City Archives, Paisley Heritage Centre, the National Records of Scotland, The National Library of Scotland, The National Archive Kew and The National Co-operative Archive, Manchester. The accounts were developed however, with the intention of exploring their contemporary significance and were shared, in different formats, with local community organisations. Permissions were obtained and sessions were taped, although unfortunately, the quality of the tape from Kinning Park precludes extensive direct transcription. The discussions and follow-up activity were analysed to consider what they suggest about ideas of community, public history and the ways in which a historical perspective might contribute to contemporary issues. The work was exploratory and carried out within a framework that stressed the importance of ethical practice and a focus on participatory approaches and community benefit wherever possible.

The historical examples

The two cases are: the Kinning Park Co-operative Women's Guild (hereafter KPCWG) and the Paisley Community Development Project (hereafter Paisley CDP). KPCWG was the first Co-operative Women's Guild in Scotland, founded in 1890 on the south side of Glasgow (Dollan 1923: 143), and the Paisley CDP, which operated in Ferguslie Park in Paisley between 1972 and 1977, was the only one of twelve local action research projects, part of the Home Office Community Development Programme, which was located in Scotland. Both initiatives occurred at points of economic transformation and transition in relation to ideas of social welfare. KPCWG developed while Glasgow enjoyed its reputation as the second city of the Empire and during the debates that led to the liberal welfare reforms of 1906-1914. Paisley CDP as the economy of the West of Scotland was exposed to global competition and at what can be seen as the beginning of the unravelling of the post war consensus which had supported the brief interlude of the 'classic welfare state' (Harris 2004). They also provide interesting points of contrast. KPCWG is an example of local agency. The Guild worked with its own definition of its local community, developed using its own resources, built its own leadership and worked on both local and national issues in relation to social welfare. Paisley CDP in contrast, had an external locus of control; it worked with an administrative definition of its local community, both teams were largely professionals drawn from outside the area. The resources were a combination of central and local government funding and the agenda was determined, at least initially, within the Home Office. Both initiatives had some national impact; members of KPCWG were key to the establishment of the Scottish Cooperative Women's Guild (Buchan 1913: 1), the first organisation of working class women in Scotland, and Paisley CDP, although

not well represented in the national literature on the CDPs is covered in two of the joint reports and had some role in bringing learning from the projects to the community development initiatives north of the border (Barr 1991).

The rules of Kinning Park Co-operative Society (hereafter KPCS) registered on July 7th 1871 made provision for an allowance for educational purposes to be made from the revenues (Dollan 1923). From small beginnings, by 1890 these revenues stood at £21,326. 5s 7d in share capital, deposits and loans and reserves of £955. 10s 11d (ibid: 232), and it was members of the education committee who supported the establishment of the KPCWG. Reflecting on the early work of the Guild, Mrs Ritchie (1908:6) states 'our Guilds were first formed to be a source of mutual aid and social intercourse for the women of the movement as well as to spread a knowledge of the advantages and principles of co-operation'. Founded on the co-operative ideas of industry, mutual aid and democratic control, the early work of the Guild focused on domestic skills with cookery and sewing classes and exhibitions of handicrafts accompanied by cultural and social events. This developed to include the writing and reading of papers on topics of local and national interest, and involvement in some of the major issues of the time, health, housing and women's employment conditions, the feeding of school children, old age pensions, and women's suffrage.

The Home Office press release that announced the national Community Development Project on July 16th 1969 stated:

> This will be a neighbourhood-based experiment aimed at finding new ways of meeting the needs of people living in areas of high social deprivation: by bringing together the work of all the social services under the leadership of a special project team and also by tapping resources of self-help and mutual help which may exist among the people of the neighbourhood' (TNA 1969).

Ferguslie Park was announced as the location for the single local project in Scotland in December 1971 with the first appointment to the staff team starting in August 1972 (Paisley Burgh Council 1971). Building on the tradition of community organising in the area, work focused on a local information and advice centre, the development of tenant groups pressing for repairs, maintenance and regeneration of housing, employment initiatives and education. There was also ongoing support to play-schemes, youth groups, a lunch club and a community minibus.

The instigators of the CDP in the Home Office saw the issue of poverty as essentially limited to small pockets of the country and the result of cycles of deprivation and cultures of poverty. The Community

Development Projects developed a different analysis which located persistent poverty and increasing unemployment as the result of wider social and economic conditions associated with the restructuring of the UK economy in the early 1970s. This analysis was shared by the project in Ferguslie Park which stated that 'the basic problems arise from the unequal distribution of wealth and power showing up particularly in the high incidence of unemployment, low incomes and poor housing' (SRC 1977).

Initial engagement

Two different methods were employed to engage with contemporary local community organisations. Both involved an element of cold calling, and developed differently. In the case of Ferguslie Park, this was a slow process and was built via interviews for the case study. An initial series of visits to the local community centre, the Tannahill Centre, looking for potential contacts finally resulted in an interview with the centre manager who provided a key link. In an area which has a history of being researched and written about and an understandable reluctance to engage with yet another researcher, the fact that I had recently worked with a former, well-respected worker in the area, played a key role in gaining access. In the course of these interviews the possibility of sharing materials was raised and two sessions were organised in conjunction with the Tannahill Centre to do this.

In Kinning Park, the approach was more direct. Aware of an active local organisation based in an old school in the area, the Kinning Park Complex, an e-mail was sent to the Director sharing some basic information about the size and scale of the Kinning Park Co-operative Society and the fact that the KPCWG was the first in Scotland and offering to visit to share findings. This was enthusiastically accepted and a subsequent meeting with the Director and a curatorial student from Glasgow School of Art led to an invitation to provide a 'talk' as part of their regular community meal, linked to International Women's Day.

Initial presentation of materials

Both approaches required some form of presentation of materials and as such can be characterised as public engagement sessions. The fact that Paisley CDP was more recent meant that reports written at the time and some photographs were available as artefacts. These were supplemented by photocopied extracts from community newsletters, local authority and Home Office records and, some basic collations of information such as a staff list for the project and basic time line. These provided the basis for an informal run through the material collected which laid the ground work for a subsequent discussion. A discussion guide was produced although not strictly adhered to allowing for the discussion to flow.

Given the time frame involved, all sources for KPCWG were archival and thus more difficult to provide direct access to. Also, despite being in the context of a community meal, the hall was large and in many ways more formal, so it was decided that a simple PowerPoint presentation would be most effective. This incorporated a small number of available images with direct quotations and an outline of the developing analysis. The presentation was followed by questions and answers and wider discussion.

Follow on activities

In both areas the initial engagement has led to follow up activities. In Ferguslie Park the idea of an exhibition and archive using the CDP materials as a starting point was discussed and subsequent meetings held to develop this, involving local residents, the local library and the manager of the Tannahill Centre. This resulted in an initial small-scale exhibition of photographs taken by one of the CDP workers at the local gala day to develop interest. In Kinning Park, the material on the KPCWG fed into activities around the twenty-first anniversary of the complex. Links were made between the banners used by the KPCWG, a banner made by local women during the sit-in which saved the building from closure in 1992 and the commissioning of a new banner as the centrepiece for a 21st anniversary march and exhibition. The open call for the banner spoke of it contributing to 'a week-long event to celebrate the power of collective voice'. Material on KPCWG was incorporated into the exhibition and Glasgow Museum's Resource Centre exhibited one of the original KPCWG's banners at the opening. Here too, there is discussion about a longer-term project curating materials from the history of Kinning Park Complex and the wider community and as a potential repository for material gathered for the case study.

Themes

Common themes are explored in relation to the ideas of community and public history as concerned with place and locality, with new areas of interest and discovery, as being a potential source of empowerment and means of inspiring action. It also considers the extent to which the issues in relation to a focus purely on locality and 'reclamation and celebration' are evident and themes of wider concern in relation to social welfare are covered.

Place and locality

Ferguslie Park remains an identifiable area despite the fact that it has been almost completely re-developed since the time of the Paisley CDP. Kinning Park, while originally the smallest, independent police burgh on the outskirts of Glasgow, lost some of its identity when it was incorporated into the City in 1905 (McMahon 2003: 15), and has equally been extensively redeveloped with a motorway built

through a large part of it in the 1970s. It remains a destination on the Glasgow subway but even here, is overshadowed by its larger and more famous neighbour, Govan.

In both cases the response to the material included a link to a sense of place, of locality. Discussion in Ferguslie Park covered the geography of the area; the boundaries around the area, and the fact that in the words of one local resident, 'it was known as the biggest cul-de-sac in the world', the internal divisions within the community and the role that the CDP played in building links between the different neighbourhood groups and organisations.

> The CDP did play a role in bringing the scheme together and largely the basis of FLAG was the tenants' associations. Ferguslie League of Action Groups, and most of the action groups were the tenants' associations.

Participants spoke of a strong sense of place and, despite a changing demographic, a sense of Ferguslie Park as a distinct entity and the need for new residents to understand the history of the area:

> Lots of different people have moved into the area as well…we need to be looking at that as well but based on the history of that whole thing…that people have looked at issues, have fought together, they've campaigned together, they've said "this isnae good enough, we need places for our kids to come, we need places to go and meet…"

This was not the case in Kinning Park where the sense of place was less strong. The Kinning Park Complex has strong local roots, having been saved from closure by a sit-in of local women, and it also draws on a wider constituency of artists and activists who rent studio and other space in the building. A key area of initial interest from the Director was how the materials might provide a link to a sense of place, rooting the building in a distinctive Kinning Park identity, rather than it being seen as part of it more famous neighbour, Govan. Interestingly, discussion in the session covered the extent to which this was possible and there were views on either side.

A connection to the past and hidden histories
In both cases the materials created an interest in a connection to the past. In Ferguslie Park where some participants had been directly involved, this took the form of reminiscences about the actual project and also of subsequent developments and initiatives in the area. Memories shared were not exclusively about the CDP but in places more generally a discussion about the past and how it differed from the present.

They also at times contradicted the materials from the archival records, raising issues in relation to memory and its role in constructing interpretations of the past.

> Looking back over the past 30-40 years, I just think things have got worse and I think Ferguslie Park has just been decimated. When you look at the projects etc., the support that was in the area, it's just gone. I think the stuffing has been knocked out of the people of Ferguslie Park. There is still an element of community cohesion, but in terms of actually going out and doing things and the things we used to get involved in, it's just gone.

There was no-one to provide such a direct connection to the material in Kinning Park and so, rather than a focus on reminiscence, the discussion centred more around discovery, wanting to explore more information on different aspects of the material. In response to a photograph of the first committee of KPCWG, someone asked if they really were working-class women as 'they looked a bit too grand'. There was a series of other questions about how they connected to other organisations in the city at the time, to women who have had a higher public profile such as Mary Barbour (active in the rent strikes of 1915) and the extent to which they met with opposition from men both within and outside of the co-operative movement. Comments also touched on the idea of 'people's history' and the fact that 'a lot of this is missing' and the importance of such materials in allowing people to re-establish a link to their own history. The importance of this not always being written by 'outsiders' was also highlighted.

The focus on discovery also extended to the mechanics of the archival work; what had been looked at, where records are located and how participants might access them. 'How easy was it to find out about this group – could you just google it or did you have to look at archives?' This connected to ideas of the invisibility of women's histories particularly on the internet and the need to think about how best to make the material accessible and searchable on the web.

A source of inspiration

The size and scale of the Kinning Park Co-operative Society surprised participants. Figures extracted from the accounts and information about the shops, warehouses and factories based in the area were new to them. Equally while there was some knowledge of the KPCWG as the first in Scotland, largely derived from one photograph which survives in the Glasgow City Archives collection, participants were unaware of the size and scope of their activities. Participants spoke of the role that an awareness of such developments in the past can play in inspiring activity in the present. In addition the importance of

uncovering these often 'hidden histories' of working class communities and their organisations, and the role this can play in creating a sense of continuity and possibility.

A sense of continuity and possibility was present in Ferguslie Park, provided by the activists who could trace their involvement back to the CDP. Here, inspiration appeared to be drawn from remembering a time when the scheme was 'on the up' and there was a level of community activism to make things happen and a level of resources to support this. Responding to the material one local resident commented:

> I think it may well just enthuse, because it certainly enthused me just to have a wee look at it and I think it does spark a lot of things.

This was followed by discussion on whether the historical material might remind people of former 'exciting times' and how useful it would be to 're-ignite the passion again'.

A focus on activism and collective approaches

While much of the focus was undoubtedly local, it was not exclusively so and connections were built to wider issues of public concern and activism around social welfare. In Kinning Park, links were made to current small-scale workers co-operatives in the city and whether these might build into a new co-operative movement more akin to that of Kinning Park than the 'big business' that the co-operative brand has become. There was also speculation about whether members of KPCWG drew on previous experience of activism in the area with mention of Chartist activity. In Ferguslie Park, a thread connecting much of the discussion was identified as the 'strength of the people' and a key legacy of the CDP was that:

> People had the knowledge of what they could do if they got together and held together. And they knew how to argue their case, they were not stupid…it gave people the knowledge that I can challenge you, I can tell you what is wrong.

There was also a recognition of the dangers of just focusing on a celebratory story; on the tremendous spirit and capacity of many people to thrive in adverse circumstances. Participants discussed anger at the fact that the area continues to be the single most deprived area measured by the Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation and that the need for this to change should be an important theme in any future

work. There was also a recognition of a changed context and the impact of the 'welfare to work' agenda and new employment patterns on people's ability to be involved in community activity.

A link to current practice

Comparisons were drawn in both settings between the historical material, the time under consideration, and the present. In both cases connections were made to issues of concern. In Ferguslie Park participants highlighted the fact that despite numerous different programmes over the years since the CDP, the issues of poverty, unemployment, education, the need for advice and information continue to be key issues affecting the area. Differences in resources were highlighted. From being one of 26 community libraries in Renfrewshire with a staff of eleven, Ferguslie Library is now one of six libraries, with a staff of three.

> The last time it (Ferguslie Park) was on the up was about 20 years ago. That was a big… you had a strong library, you had the arts, the health project… you had everything, community radio…and a sense of workers and volunteers working together.

In Kinning Park, discussion covered the so called 'domestic agenda' of the KPCWG and their interest in health, women's working conditions and the medical inspection and feeding of school children. The fact that KPC raised its own funds from its retail sales and was able to determine its own priorities was compared to the social enterprise model currently operating within the Complex and parallels were drawn between the KPCWG meetings which combined home industries with the reading of papers, discussion and social activities, with the community meal, talk and banner-making workshop which were taking place alongside the session.

Conclusions

The analysis supports the contention that an historical perspective and an awareness of past activity can be of value to contemporary community organisations as they imagine their futures. Two communities have access to original accounts of past activities within their communities which they can now draw on as they imagine their futures. While there are clear caveats based on the size of sample, there is evidence that access to such historical material can play a role in building links for current community organisations to a sense of their past. In both cases it appears to have reinforced a link to ideas of place and locality and the discovery, and rediscovery of past initiatives in those places. Ideas of 'reclamation and celebration' were important but it was not solely this; and in both cases the materials offered some form

of inspiration. Given a focus on activism and collective approaches this can be seen to be akin to ideas of empowerment which are important to the current policy context, and in both cases this has led to follow on activities and an appetite for further work involving the development of histories. While the initial work has been carried out largely within an essentially academic model of history, this creates the possibility for experimentation with more collaborative approaches.

Engaging with the historical examples also provided the basis for comparisons to be made between the present and the past; with the current situations the organisations are working in and exploration of the continuities and discontinuities in the issues being worked on and in the practice approaches adopted. This provided the basis for discussion about how things might be different in the future, including ideas of hopes and aspirations for their local area and the work of their organisations. While this was limited by the time involved, there is also potential here to expand such conversations building engagement across all the examples in the study and the communities involved to take a more detailed look at what, if any, lessons the historical material can offer to the present.

References

ASHTON, P. and KEAN, H. (2008). *Public History and Heritage Today: People and their Pasts*. Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan.

BAUMAN, Z. (2001). *Community: Seeking Safety in an Insecure World*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

BUCHAN, A. (1913). *History of the Scottish Co-operative Women's Guild, 1892-1913*. Glasgow: Scottish Co-operative Women's Guild.

COMMISSION ON THE FUTURE COMMISSION ON THE FUTURE DELIVERY OF PUBLIC SERVICES (2011). Available from www.gov.scot/Publications/2011/06/27154527/0.

CROW, G. and MAH, A. (2011). *Conceptualisations and Meanings of 'community': The Theory and Operationalisation of a Contested Concept*. AHRC Research Report: University of Warwick.

CROW, G. (2014). 'The Sociology of Community', in Holmwood, J. and Scott, J. (eds.) *Palgrave Handbook of Sociology in Britain*, Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan. pp 374-391.

DELANTY, G.(2003).*Community*. London:Routledge.

DOLLAN, P.J. (1923). *Jubilee History of the Kinning Park Co-operative Society Limited*. Glasgow: The Kinning Park Co-operative Society Ltd.

FINLAYSON, G. (1994). *Citizen, State and Social Welfare in Britain, 1830 – 1990*.Oxford: Clarendon Press.

FLINN, A. (2007). 'Community Histories, Community Archives: Some Opportunities and Challenges', *Journal of the Society of Archivists*, 28(2), pp.151-176.

FLINN, A. (2011). 'Archival Activism: Independent and Community-led Archives. Radical Public History and the Heritage Professions', *Interactions, UCAL Journal of Education and Information Studies* 7(2), pp.1-20.

HARRIS, B. (2004).*The Origins of the British Welfare State: Society,State,and Social Welfare in England and Wales,1800-1945*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

KEAN, H. (2010). 'People, Historians and Public History: Demystifying the Process of History Making', *Public Historian*, 32(3), pp. 25-38.

KEAN, H. and MARTIN, P. (eds.) (2013). *The Public History Reader*. London: Routledge.

McMASHON, A.J. (2003). *A History of Kinning Park and District, Glasgow*. Aberdeen: The Queen's Nursing Institute of Scotland.

MOONEY, G and Scott G. (2011). 'Social Justice, Social Welfare and Devolution: Nationalism and Social Policy Making in Scotland', *Poverty and Public Policy* 3(4) pp. 1-19.

PAISLEY BOROUGH COUNCIL (1971). Minutes of the Law and General Purposes Committee, 21.12.1972. Paisley Heritage Centre.

RICTCHIE, (1908). *Food for Reflection*. Glasgow: Scottish Co-operative Wholesale Society Ltd.

SAMUEL, R. (1994). *Theatres of Memory*, London: Verso.

SOMERVILLE, P. (2016) *Understanding Community: Politics, Policy and Practice*. Bristol: Policy Press.

SRC 1977. Future Arrangements for Ferguslie Park: A CDP Perspective, October 1977. SRC3/81/5/66, Glasgow City Archive.

TOSH, J. (2014). 'Public History, Civic Engagement and the Historical Profession in Britain', *History* Volume 99, pp.191-212.

TNA 1969. Community Development Project Steering Group. HLG118/2792, The National Archives.

WILLIAMS, R. (1976). *Keywords: A Vocabulary of Culture and Society*, London: Penguin.

Postgraduate Transitions from Masters to Doctoral Study: Managing Independence, Emotions and Support

Charlotte McPherson, Samantha Punch and Elizabeth Graham

University of Stirling, charlotte.mcpherson@stir.ac.uk
University of Stirling, s.v.punch@stir.ac.uk
University of Stirling, elizabeth-anne.graham@stir.ac.uk

Abstract: As elsewhere in the world, higher education (HE) provision and uptake in the United Kingdom (UK) has grown exponentially since the widening participation agenda begun in the 1970s, and research has predicted that by 2030 there will be an increase in global HE student enrolment of well over 300% (University World News 2012). As HE has grown and changed, so too has interest in it, and there now exists a substantial literature on student transitions to undergraduate education. However, the experiences and perspectives of students transitioning at the postgraduate level have been significantly overlooked, largely due to powerful assumptions around postgraduate students being HE 'experts' for whom educational transitions are presumed to be 'natural'. The relative lack of research conducted on these transitions is particularly surprising given the significant growth of, and major changes to, the postgraduate sector in recent years, and despite growing state involvement in its performance. Universities are under increasing pressure to more explicitly demonstrate the value of postgraduate education, and particularly doctoral degrees, to the burgeoning 'knowledge economy', which increasingly positions doctoral researchers as "knowledge workers" rather than students (Hughes and Tight 2013: 771). These pressures have produced significant changes in how the doctorate is structured and supervised, has placed different and additional expectations on PhD students beyond their thesis and, in turn, has cultivated a qualitatively different academic community in which they are expected to transition and thrive. This paper addresses gaps in understanding around both the transitions of doctoral students and the impact of wider changes to HE on these experiences by synthesising the available literature on postgraduate transitions and the broader academic climate alongside qualitative focus group data from a small-scale project conducted with doctoral students and supervisors conducted in the social sciences faculty of a Scottish university. It finds that transitions to doctoral education are complex, demanding and emotional, as well as exciting, and that changes to the academic community in recent years are creating new and significant pressures for both doctoral students and academic staff which can further complicate transitions and progress.

Keywords: doctoral students, educational transitions, institutional practices, changes to higher education

Introduction

The United Kingdom's (UK) higher education (HE) sector has long been considered one of the best in the world (Lea 2009; Maringe and Gibbs 2009). The prestige of many UK HE institutions (HEIs), the global weight and recognition of British qualifications, and the level of priority and positivity accorded to the worth and value of HE in public and political discourse has earned it an enviable international reputation. Indeed, while the UK represents just 0.9% of the world's population, it accounts for 4.2% of researchers, 3.2% of global research and 15.9% of the world's most highly cited journals, and is the world's fourth largest producer of PhDs (Department for Business, Innovation and Skills 2013; Mellors-Bourne et al. 2014).

HE student numbers have risen exponentially since the 1970s, and recent research has forecast that by 2030 there will be a 314% increase in global HE student enrolment, with particularly substantial growth predicted for undergraduate study (University World News 2012). The comparatively larger undergraduate population has thus long commandeered the majority of HE resources, policymaking and research attention, rendering the rapidly growing postgraduate sector relatively overlooked. Little is known about the transitions undertaken by postgraduate students, despite the fact that changes in the economy and labour market are resulting in a sharp increase in the number of people entering or returning to postgraduate study.

Indeed, in the last 25 years, the postgraduate sector has been the largest growth area in HE in the UK, United States (US), Australasia and Europe (Wisker 2012), with Wakeling and Kyriacou (2010: 12) describing the phenomenon as a "quiet revolution". The taught postgraduate (PGT) population has increased by over 54% since 2002/03 and recent research found a 41% increase in the number of doctorates achieved in the US between 2003 and 2013 (Gould 2015). A considerable literature exploring the reasons behind this substantial increase in participation in postgraduate education exists, most of which points to 'credential inflation', whereby the massification of HE since the 1970s has progressively devalued undergraduate qualifications, saturating the labour market with equally qualified graduates who are increasingly turning to PGT and research postgraduate (PGR) degrees to differentiate themselves to employers (Mellors-Bourne et al. 2014; Ellison and Purcell 2015).

There are also strong links between rising postgraduate participation and the priorities of the so-called 'knowledge economy', which demands and depends on a specialised, highly trained and educated workforce (Christie et al. 2005). One effect of the 'knowledge economy' and concurrent narratives around lifelong learning and upskilling has been a growing state involvement and interest in the performance of the postgraduate sector, with universities under increasing pressure to make doctoral degrees more demonstrably valuable to the economy (Willmott 1995; Goluvshkina and Milligan 2012; Kallio et al. 2016). This has not only made doctorates more structured and regulated undertakings, but has, according to Hughes and Tight (2013: 771) repositioned PhD students in public discourse as "knowledge workers with obligations to the economy".

Whilst more is known about the postgraduate sector than before due to its expanding student body and its growing importance to political and economic agendas, the transitions and experiences of postgraduate students into and within this greatly changed academic community remain relatively poorly understood (McPherson et al. 2017). This paper seeks to address this gap by reviewing some key literature on postgraduate transitions and is specifically focused on the experiences of doctoral students. It draws from qualitative focus group data from a small-scale research project conducted with doctoral students and supervisors within one faculty at a Scottish university, and reflects on the challenges encountered by these students – both academic and emotional – at the beginning of their PGR studies.

Background

The dominance of the 'transition' metaphor in discussions of youth and education is well-documented (Shanahan 2000; Bynner 2005; Thomson 2008), and has traditionally focused on linear transitions between school, HE and the workplace (Christie 2009; Hamilton and Adamson 2013; Mortimer 2014). However, recent debates have increasingly challenged the reliance of the literature's dependence on such a traditional model of the life course, pointing to the rising trends of delayed and/or declining marriage, parenthood, residential independence and entry to the labour market that have resulted from rising unemployment, higher and longer participation in education and broader societal change (Walther 2006; Roksa and Velez 2012; Berrington and Stone 2014).

Expansive literatures exist around the educational transitions to and between primary, secondary and tertiary education (see, for example, Sirsch 2003; Aunola et al. 2006; Abbott-Chapman 2006), with a particularly large body of research dedicated to understanding the shift from school/college to undergraduate study (Haggis and Pouget 2002; Macaro and Wingate 2004; O'Donnell and Tobbell 2007; McMillan 2014). By contrast, transitions to and experiences of postgraduate education have been significantly overlooked in the literature. A number of authors have argued that the lack of attention in this area is attributable to the conventional, powerful construction of postgraduate students, and particularly doctoral students, as HE 'experts', for whom educational transitions are presumed to be 'natural' (O'Donnell et al. 2009; Tobbell et al. 2008, 2010; McPherson et al. 2017).

A growing number of studies are challenging this presumption, however, not least because it generalises the highly heterogeneous postgraduate student population, but because postgraduate and undergraduate education are significantly different undertakings. Wisker et al. (2003: 93) suggest that moving from undergraduate to postgraduate study necessitates a "leap of learning behaviours as great at least as that from pre-university to university study", alongside taking on a considerably more substantial and intellectually challenging workload and with less structure and support from academic staff (Sastry 2004; Artess et al. 2008). Indeed, it is this demand for more independent scholarship and lone-working that most clearly differentiates postgraduate from the very structured nature of undergraduate education (Phillips and Pugh 1994).

As noted, there has been a persistent assumption within HE that transitioning to more independent study and critical thinking represents a 'natural', manageable progression for highly intelligent students who, because of their previous academic achievements, will likely thrive in a more challenging context (O'Donnell et al. 2009). However, research carried out by Cluett and Skene (2006) stated that 80% of postgraduate respondents experienced the first year of their programme as 'overwhelming', whilst a survey conducted by West (2012) indicated that 64% of postgraduate students found the transition from undergraduate to postgraduate to be 'difficult'. Mounting a further challenge to the construction of doctoral students as 'experts' are results from the HEA/NUS (2013) survey, where significant proportions of postgraduates reported feeling they were inaccurately and unfairly expected to automatically know how to work and succeed at postgraduate level due to their previous educational successes. The same survey revealed that the growing demand for more independent study was identified by postgraduates as the most worrying and difficult transitional issue. Furthermore, compared with undergraduate and further education students, postgraduate students were the most likely to report feeling 'underprepared' for their studies (HEA/NUS 2013). These findings suggest that, contrary to conventional wisdom, many bright, highly capable students do not inevitably come 'equipped' for postgraduate study (O'Donnell et al. 2009; Heussi 2012).

A number of commentators have also pointed, in various ways, to HE itself as the source of many of the difficulties faced by new postgraduate students (Tobbell et al. 2008; O'Donnell et al. 2009). Some have suggested that just as there has been an identified misalignment between the curricula, priorities and structure of secondary school and university, with consequences for the performance of many first-year undergraduates (Chemers et al. 2001), the highly choreographed and supported nature of undergraduate study does not encourage students to be sufficiently creative, independent or critical in their work, as is

expected at postgraduate level. It also does not expose them, as students or practitioners, to enough research; the veritable bread-and-butter of postgraduate education and professional academia (RP Group 2010; Van der Meer et al. 2010; Cheng et al. 2015). There has been a lack of focus on the impact of other HE practices on the transitions and ongoing progress of doctoral students, however, including the effects of the major changes wrought in academic departments by growing state involvement and interest in the postgraduate sector with regards to the knowledge economy.

This paper seeks to address these gaps in the literature – the lack of focus on the difficult transitions undertaken by doctoral students and the impact of wider changes to HE on these transitions – by reviewing some key literature and drawing on data from a small-scale qualitative research project conducted in the social sciences faculty of a university in Scotland. Funded by the Stirling Enhancement of Learning Fund (SELF), the research project explored the transitions of all postgraduate students – including Masters and international students – but this paper draws specifically on focus group data with PGR students and academic supervisors. In total, this paper considers the reflections of 8 doctoral students and 15 supervisors.

From dependence to independence
Transitioning to postgraduate study is a complex, often bewildering process, that requires the abandonment and reconsideration of many of the educational doctrines instilled and accepted at undergraduate level (Phillips and Pugh 1994; Wakeling and Kyriacou 2010). Whilst the challenging nature of the transitions undertaken by all new postgraduates needs to be better acknowledged in research, it is arguably most important to recognise and explore the particularly significant leap made by doctoral students, who exit 'taught' education entirely as they enter their almost exclusively self-directed doctoral studies (Geiger 1997; Austin 2002; Dedrick and Watson 2002). Indeed, whilst the transition to PGT study is undoubtedly complex and challenging (see McPherson et al. 2017), Masters degrees typically contain remnants of the undergraduate formula, whilst the doctorate bears very little, if any, resemblance to prior higher educational experience (see Table 1).

Table 1: Differences between PGR and previous learning experiences at undergraduate and PGT level.

Theme	Detail
Level of knowledge	Significantly deeper; a contributory role to knowledge expected rather than just recipient of it; expected to master and become expert of field.
Duration of study	Three years (full-time); six years (part-time).
Academic focus	Much more specific/refined than the more general overview of undergraduate; more detail and scope than at Masters level.
Teaching environment	Traditionally no taught element (professional doctorates include taught modules).
Learning style	Immersive, independent study.
Nature and quantity of staff contact	Much flatter hierarchy between staff and student; less instruction; increasingly collegial.
Assessment style	Unlike at undergraduate and PGT level, not assessed via set module essays/exams. Assessed

entirely on substantial thesis and production of original contributions to knowledge.

The strangeness of this new environment, and its irreconcilability with past educational experience, can disorientate many first-year doctoral students who, with a relatively undefined time horizon, and a task of overwhelming and uncertain proportions, often do not know how or where to begin (Hockey 1991; Delamont et al. 2004). These feelings were shared by the doctoral students in the Scottish study, many of whom described being daunted about both the long journey ahead and the onus on them as independent scholars:

> The task of planning and completing a PhD on my own terms is pretty terrifying. Going from zero words to 80,000 in just three years is a daunting prospect and on top of that trying to have what I write be worthwhile and make a useful contribution rather than just waffle. (Louise, doctoral student)

> A PhD leaves you to find your own way through the academic jungle, desperately hoping you are on the correct path. The PhD requires so much more emotional intelligence and maturity than previous academic work. (Anthony, doctoral student)

Having spent years being guided, supported and assessed in much more heavily structured educational contexts, the self-directed nature of PGR degrees, combined with expectations around the size, calibre and value of the work to be produced, caused many of the participants to feel disorientated:

> I do feel at this point that I could bin a month and nobody would notice. And it should be a good feeling, like yeah, I could milk it for all it's worth, but at the same time you need that level of structure. (Lisa, doctoral student)

> Now I am working completely under my own steam and have periods where I feel as though I'm wading through paper after paper with no real direction as yet… I'm not used to this kind of freedom. In many ways it's liberating and empowering but at the same time I end up going through phases where I'm expecting someone to walk through the door, tell me that there's been a horrible mistake and that in fact I wasn't supposed to be selected for the studentship. (Sean, doctoral student)

These concerns were also acknowledged by supervisors in the study, who highlighted the shift to significantly more independent study as a challenging transitional barrier for many new doctoral students:

> I think that some students can find the organising of their own deadlines and schedules challenging. It can take some students a while to work out who is responsible for which aspects of the work. (Kim, supervisor)

> The anxiety of self-directed work is probably quite a key experience/issue. (Bradley, supervisor)

As noted, it is often assumed that the transition to more independent working simply represents a natural, manageable step-up for highly intelligent, capable postgraduate students (O'Donnell et al. 2009). These testimonies from both students and staff not only challenge these assumptions, but also point to how students' anxieties around self-directed study can engender feelings of 'imposter syndrome', a common and often very debilitating experience for many doctoral students who are typically unused to feeling unsettled and insecure in academic contexts.

Imposters

Due to their prior successes, students typically navigate the pathway to doctoral study with a strong sense of themselves as successful, intelligent holders of well- and hard-earned qualifications (Phillips and Pugh

1994). However, it is not long before this initial confidence, self-belief and enthusiasm can deteriorate and they begin to question themselves and their capabilities, particularly as their contact with academic staff, more experienced students and the wider professional academic discourse increases and changes over time (Phillips and Pugh 1994; Coryell et al. 2013). This often manifests in 'imposter syndrome', a state of anxiety and self-doubt in which doctoral students feel undeserving and incapable of their new educational status, and await being 'found out' by their funders, supervisors or postgraduate colleagues (Cope-Watson and Betts 2010; Deconinck 2015). This state of anxiety and self-doubt is typically temporary, but potentially enduring, for many students. It can be clearly linked to how the doctorate, and doctoral holder, have been positioned in academic and public discourse as the epitome of intellectual success and ability.

Hayton (2015) rejects and subverts this typical construction of the doctorate, and argues that PhDs should be understood as the bottom layer of professional academia, rather than the top layer of educational attainment. Hayton's (2015) position helps to demystify and ground the PGR degree as an 'apprenticeship' (Lee and Green 2009) to academia rather than the pinnacle of academic attainment. The latter construction can be inhibiting for many students, who struggle to self-identify as 'brilliant', and who are intimidated by the weight of the doctorate's prestige as well as the complexity of its task. These feelings of 'imposter syndrome' were prevalent amongst the Scottish study's participants, many of whom were struggling with self-doubt and anxieties about their deservingness of a place in doctoral level education:

> There has been a lot of talk about imposter syndrome recently and this has resonated with me. Pretty much the whole time I feel like I'm not sure I should be here and that everyone else's topic sounds better and they all sound like they might be more prepared and cleverer than me. (Louise, doctoral student)

The prevalence of these feelings amongst the participants suggest that there are deep-seated, intense anxieties amongst doctoral students about their capabilities, mounting a challenge to conventional assumptions about the 'expert' status of doctoral researchers and the naturally 'smooth' transitions they are presumed to experience. As Delamont et al. (2004: 14) note, "it is hard to recognise how terrifying the new status of 'PhD student' can be… [and] many bright, clever undergraduates are paralysed by the almost invisible demands of graduate work".

The doctoral supervisors consulted in the Scottish study were well attuned to the wide range of new emotions that students were likely to face over the course of their doctorate:

> The PhD is done over the long haul so it can involve a wide range of emotions – lack of motivation, anxiety over progress, loss of focus, exhaustion. So, I think this sets the PhD apart as being a qualitatively different experience from other academic forms/projects. (Bradley, supervisor)

This gamut of emotions can be particularly debilitating for doctoral students not only because of their interference with productivity and progress, but because they are likely to be new experiences for students who have typically proceeded through education relatively straightforwardly and very successfully. In navigating their transitions to PGR education, the high-achieving old hands of undergraduate and PGT study are suddenly the new-starts, often in a campus where they have studied and/or lived for years, in a status reversal that may not only further disorientate already dazed new doctoral students, but may also build a personal sense of inadequacy and self-doubt (Sambrook et al. 2008; Wisker 2012).

Changes to HE and their impact on doctoral transitions and experiences
Posing further challenges, but also opportunities, to doctoral students is the number of changes made to the delivery, structure and assessment of PGR education in recent years. As recognition about the numerous academic and emotional challenges encountered by doctoral students has grown to disrupt narratives of 'HE experts', and as the state has paid more attention to the performance of the postgraduate sector, a number of major changes have occurred in how the doctorate is assessed and supervised. This has included PGR degrees becoming progressively more regulated and structured

undertakings, with compulsory training elements and milestones, and a strong emphasis on building an academic community of formal and informal support and mentorship with peers and staff (Petre and Rugg 2010).

There have been growing demands from the government for universities to more transparently and explicitly demonstrate the long-term benefits of doctoral education to society, which has resulted in pressures for higher and quicker completion rates. Wisker (2012) highlights the potential impact of the rising tension between the growing emphasis on timely completion and students having the time, space and freedom to produce an original, creative and 'risky' piece of work. At a broader level, these shifting priorities and pressures have raised a number of questions around what constitutes a doctorate, and a debate has arisen concerning the tension between the 'traditional' knowledge-based doctorate, involving an original contribution to knowledge, and the more contemporary doctorate, which increasingly features large elements of formal research training, and where the emphasis is on the process rather than on the product (Young et al. 1987).

A number of commentators have criticised the introduction of formal research training within the doctoral programme as not only potentially undermining the whole definition and meaning of a doctorate, but as evidence of direct state policy to obtain greater control over the educational process (Hockey 1991; Hughes and Tight 2013). Critiques of the newly structured doctorate have also been tabled on the ground, with many of the students in the study complaining that they were now expected to commit to various tasks beyond reading, researching and writing for their actual thesis. They perceived that activities such as creating and promoting an online presence, producing research 'impact' and gaining experience in teaching occupied too much of their time. For some, this had seriously compromised the impression they initially had of the doctorate as an immersive, once in a lifetime opportunity to focus only on your research topic:

> Doesn't feel like I have the time to experience this 'greatest time, being able to spend three years focusing on one topic' that they all talk about. I feel that I am still rushing to read and then get things down on paper. (Rita, doctoral student)

> I just think that lots of other things are taking up my time at this stage and at the moment the image I had in my head of being immersed in my PhD topic is not happening. (Danielle, doctoral student)

Some of the staff shared these perspectives or observed these feelings in their doctoral students:

> I think that there is less scope to get a bit lost in the literature and to play around with ideas. It feels a bit more of a production line and... I think students are preoccupied with 'employability' from a very early stage of the PhD. (Kim, supervisor)

> I think it is working for some and not for others. Some feel it is not what they thought the PhD would be and are being marched through it with too much structure. (Samuel, supervisor)

Whilst many are against the increasingly structured, employability-focused new shape of the doctorate, others approve of these changes, citing the poor quality of undergraduate research training which can result in underprepared and detrimentally inexperienced students partaking in doctoral research, often translating into low completion and retention rates (Wilson 1987; Delamont and Atkinson 2001; Higher Education Commission 2012). Hockey (1991) has argued that these changes to the doctorate provide a much-needed structural transition between undergraduate or PGT study and doctoral education, as well as providing more opportunities for student-student and staff-student interaction, which were previously limited by the individualistic nature of the 'traditional' doctoral process. Indeed, whilst many of the changes to the doctorate have not necessarily been welcomed by many staff or students, there has been collective praise for the impact of efforts to instil a sense of supportive community in academic departments between doctoral students and staff. As Owler (2010: 291) notes, "one advantage of all the notice now paid to the doctoral degree is the number of initiatives that have been put in place to support students within many universities".

Peer support

A well-documented experience of many PGR students is isolation, which can become a significant barrier for transitional and educational progress because of its impact on self-esteem, confidence and mental wellbeing (Janta et al. 2014). The vital influence of social networks and friendships on individual educational outcomes has been well-established in the literature, including the important role it plays in providing a sense of relatability and emotional and instrumental support during particularly stressful periods (Brooks 2002; Christie et al. 2005; Brown 2009). Friends are especially beneficial for students who lack in confidence or experience, and who feel unable to seek institutional support, in that they provide an informal system of information, collective experience and reassurance (Harley et al. 2007; Menzies and Baron 2014).

Informal support networks have increasingly been embraced at an institutional level, with many universities introducing peer-mentoring schemes where more advanced students mentor new students. Peer-mentoring schemes are increasingly being provided for postgraduate students, as recognition of their needs has begun to grow, and have been widely reported to be the most effective and beneficial support initiative for addressing both the academic and emotional transitional needs of students, who can find it difficult to seek formal support (Darwin and Palmer 2009; Huang 2012; Chester et al. 2013). Beyond these schemes, many other peer-oriented initiatives have been implemented by universities in efforts to improve not only the confidence, skills and research output of their doctoral students, but to provide a better a sense of belonging and support (Wisker et al. 2009; Owler 2010). The majority of UK universities have instilled and encourage peer-led academic communities, for example, where postgraduate students can informally exchange ideas and opinions on works-in-progress and lend support to one another in particularly difficult periods (Mullen 2012; Wisker 2012).

These initiatives have been found to not only significantly reduce stress and isolation amongst doctoral students, but also to instil a sense of sociality and friendship into academic departments, the busyness of which can often inhibit the development of social networks. One of the ways in which this is achieved amongst the PGR student body is via the 9-5 approach taken by many doctoral students to their studies, meaning that they are in the department on a Monday-Friday working week basis, providing ample opportunities for friendships and support networks to emerge. This benefited many of the students in the Scottish study, who drew a lot of energy and support from their shared routines and experiences with their peers:

> I am enjoying the friendships with my fellow PhD students and our interesting (or silly) conversations over lunch/coffee, which I think is important to break up the day. (Daniella, doctoral student)

> Having an office and using it is definitely a good thing. We are lucky to have a good group who are in most of the time and to be able to share issues and problems. (Gemma, doctoral student)

> I think that having peers going through the same thing as me is going to be hugely helpful because when things get frustrating, we can talk them through and we can relate to one another. (Yvonne, doctoral student)

The importance of peers as a source of support was also identified as key by staff in the focus groups, with one supervisor remarking that "being part of a community of other postgraduate students is crucial" (Bradley, supervisor). However, a number of supervisors also highlighted some potential drawbacks of the intensive focus on peer support, with one noting the potential for students to over-rely on general advice from peers in place of guidance more specific to their own doctoral situation:

> Some students are making too much use of generic advice from fellow students or other staff which reflects treating the PhD as if it were a structured, generic programme, when more bespoke and conditional issues usually apply. (Darren, supervisor)

Some supervisors also noted that peer support can sometimes actually produce negative effects on students' self-esteem and progress by becoming competitive rather than purely supportive. It should also

be noted that not all doctoral students are able, or inclined, to adopt a 9-5, Monday-Friday approach to their doctorates. Many have to work to fund their doctorates, are studying on a part-time basis, have children or other caring commitments, and/or live some distance from campus (Thomson et al. 2002; Taylor and Beasley 2005). For these students, developing and benefiting from a peer-oriented supportive academic community is much more difficult. This is an important and considerable issue because, unlike undergraduates, whose social and academic lives often converge, the older and more heterogeneous postgraduate population invariably have more complex and demanding 'home' lives, as well as a more challenging workload, and this can seriously complicate their transitions (Tobbell et al. 2008). The complexity of this 'multimembership' (Wenger 1998: 105) involves students in negotiating ways to enable the emergence of an academic identity and can impact on their ability to become socially integrated with, and thus supported by, peers or staff.

Staff support
Over the past 10-15 years, as the importance of generating skilled researchers has grown in public discourse, universities have invested considerable effort and resources into improving the doctoral research environment and enhancing student-staff relationships (Wisker 2012; Clarke and Lunt 2014). Primarily, there has been a significant emphasis on improving doctoral supervision, perceived as playing a crucial role in empowering students to become researchers (Adkins 2009; Wisker 2012). Historically, supervision has been guided by the assumption that doctoral students have the confidence and capabilities to cope with the demands of PGR study (Johnson et al. 2000; Taylor and Beasley 2005). However, given the transitional issues identified here, there is felt to be a growing need for supervisors to recognise that students, regardless of ability, often struggle at the start, and throughout, their doctorate, and can require more 'hands on' support (Gurr 2001; Taylor and Beasley 2005).

Moreover, the diversification of the postgraduate population, including the doctoral student body, brings with it a multitude of motivations and aspirations behind students' participation in postgraduate study (Tobbell et al. 2008, 2010; Tobbell and O'Donnell 2013). As a result of this, and of the noted rising pressure on universities to increase completion and retention rates as well as the production of skilled researchers of value to the economy, supervision has changed from a typically 'hidden', two-way relationship between student and supervisor to a highly structured and managed supervisory team, who must be sensitive and responsive to education and employment trends (Gurr 2001; Petre and Rugg 2010; Wisker 2012). Supervisors are also increasingly expected to attend to the pastoral as well as purely academic needs of their students (Easterby-Smith et al. 2002; Sambrook et al. 2008).

Whilst supervisors are expected to *do* and *be* more for their students, much is also expected of doctoral students, who are increasingly encouraged to set the agenda of supervision meetings and to gradually become more expert than their supervisors on their topic. The paradigmatic shift entailed in this from the typical staff-student hierarchy these students have been accustomed to, to varying degrees, since primary school is considerable and can be both empowering and intimidating. This was the case in the Scottish study, where a mixture of emotions around supervision was reported:

> Doing well and having my supervisors believe in me has really helped my confidence. (Danielle, doctoral student)

> The supervisory relationship is very new and very different to Masters where they have more power. Whereas now they are saying you need to have ideas, you need to be the expert, you should be setting the agenda. And I find that incredibly difficult because these people are experts and I am no different from when I finished the Masters to starting the PhD... I can't change overnight. (Sandra, doctoral student)

Supervisors clearly play a vital role not only in helping new doctoral students develop their research skills and knowledge, but also in the ontology of students *becoming* and *feeling like* researchers and valued participants in academic communities. However, as these testimonies show, the flatter hierarchy between staff and students, and the near role reversal eventually expected, can be intimidating and concerning for students new to PGR study. A number of authors have highlighted the importance (and difficulty) of striking the right balance between supporting students on the pathway to independence without

encouraging continued dependence. Gurr (2001) recommends a trajectory of supervision which begins 'hands on' and becomes progressively 'hands off' in response to student need and their (hopefully) growing confidence in both their work and their capabilities (Delamont et al. 2004; Lee 2012; Wisker 2012).

Differences in how students interact with staff at PGR level are not limited to their dealings with supervisors, however. Whilst contact time with staff significantly decreases in teaching/learning scenarios at doctoral level, it is also increased in another sense, with doctoral students often working alongside staff within the same departments during the working week; sharing the same communal spaces, including kitchens, eating areas, corridors and photocopiers; working on projects and papers with them outside of their own studies/supervision team; and tutoring on their modules for extra income and experience. Universities have been keen to maximise the occurrence and benefits of this contact, and a strong literature exists describing the positive effects of regular and meaningful contact time with staff on doctoral students' sense of confidence, motivation and institutional belonging (see, for example, Ryan and Viete 2009; Griffin and Novotny 2012).

Staff are often actively encouraged to spend time getting to know doctoral students within their departments, in efforts to collapse student-staff barriers, circulate useful and supportive information and to help newcomers settle in. Whilst this worked well in terms of peer support for many of the participants in the Scottish study, most reported feeling little sense of community with staff and with their supervisory team:

> Peer relationships are great, but I don't feel that staff are all that interested. (Rita, doctoral student)

> I don't think that many staff have asked me about my research. I think there is a definite lack of community spirit within the department. (Max, doctoral student)

These testimonies suggest there is still some work to do to better mix doctoral students with academic staff, and also hints at how important staff involvement is – even at an informal level – in creating, or disrupting, a sense of community amongst new and nervous doctoral students. The study revealed a real appetite for more everyday contact with staff, and not necessarily on a formal basis but rather in a similar way to how the students interacted with and supported one another, with a focus on hearing about each other's work and how the other is getting on:

> Staff having informal chats in the common room with students over lunch etc. would be useful. It would let people know who is researching what but on an informal basis. (Sandra, doctoral student)

However, just as changes to the economy and labour market and thus to HE has significantly altered the structure, process and experience of the doctorate, these shifts have also placed significant pressures on academics. Like doctoral students, their focus and priorities are now expected to be multiple rather than unilateral, and a number of commentators have drawn attention to growing pressures on busy staff to produce impactful research alongside heaped teaching schedules, and the impact this can have on their ability to interact meaningfully and supportively with doctoral students (Gewirtz 2008; Yarwood-Ross and Haigh 2014; Li 2015). This was reflected in the focus group data from staff in the study, with some explaining that they often simply do not have enough time to have coffee and catch up with doctoral students:

> Sometimes you are hard pushed for time and it can put you under pressure for the rest of the day if you sit down [with a PhD student in the common room]. (Samuel, supervisor)

Other staff members cited the growing number of doctoral students in the department as making it very difficult, if not impossible, to get to know all of them, with one supervisor actually describing feeling too intimidated by the number of doctoral students in a communal eating area to go in. Another noted that staff often make an effort with doctoral students but it is not always reciprocated:

>   Sometimes I can put a lot of effort into organising things and then no one takes it up, so I feel disappointed at the level of effort not being taken up. (Samuel, supervisor)

What all of these staff and student testimonies suggest is that while significant progress has been made in shifting away from the traditionally very individualistic nature of the doctorate towards more of a community atmosphere/experience, new and considerable pressures on both staff and doctoral students can limit opportunities to meet and mix with one another. It can also impact on how support is construed, with the rising number of doctoral students and the shrinking number of academic job opportunities available sometimes creating a sense of negative competitiveness in some departments and scenarios that not only threatens efforts to build community spirit into faculties, but which has also produced negative narratives around the value and process of PGR education itself.

Light in the dark
As the literature and the data presented here demonstrates, undertaking a doctorate is a challenging, daunting process that is often understandably fraught with self-doubt, disillusion and disorientation, particularly at the beginning. However, a story far less told in recent research is how rewarding and exciting commencing and participating in PGR education can be for those involved in it. In the Scottish study, a mixture of emotions characterised the early months of the participants' doctorates, with the soaring highs of excitement and a sense of intense privilege occurring alongside, and often dwarfing, deep personal doubts and anxieties:

>   I think that it is difficult not to doubt yourself and I had worries about not being clever or intelligent enough. However, I was excited and thrilled at the prospect of starting my doctorate and I was confident that I did have the determination to do it so there was a mixture of emotions. (Yvonne, doctoral student)

>   [I feel] fear because I no longer have someone to structure my learning and development for me. But having said that I'm also so excited about the next three years and when I try to think of my PhD completion as a job rather than as being a student I realise it's pretty much the best job in the world as far as I'm concerned. (Louise, doctoral student)

>   I'm so excited that I'm working on a project that has the potential to make a real difference in so many spheres of work and every now and then I get these euphoric feelings when I remember this. (Sean, doctoral student)

Unsurprisingly, despite their nerves, at the outset of their PGR degrees, these doctoral students were ultimately mobilised by the passion they felt for their projects and the prospect of getting to focus on developing these interests, and themselves, in the coming few years. The motivation, industry, confidence and enjoyment of academic tasks and life that had served them so well throughout their past educational experiences combined to create real excitement about the doctoral journey ahead; an immersive, challenging and highly respected and rewarded academic process. It seems important that in our efforts to explore and expose the academic and emotional challenges inherent in PGR education that we do not forget to acknowledge the genuine excitement, commitment and confidence of doctoral students in the process.

It is also important to guard against submitting to negativity around the worthwhileness of participating in PGR education in general. Negativity around the doctoral experience has been largely mobilised by concerns at both a state and student level about the long-term value and benefits of undertaking postgraduate, and particularly doctoral, study. Whilst it is undeniable that changes to the labour market and in the economy has produced a surplus of doctoral candidates and holders relative to academic vacancies, a research report by the Careers Research and Advisory Centre (CRAC) (2013) shows that whilst PGT and undergraduate students' employability has been negatively impacted by economic downturn, over 90% of doctoral graduate respondents were in employment, signalling that doctoral holders appear relatively 'recession-proof'. There is thus cause for optimism for transitioning out of postgraduate education into work despite the insecurities of the UK labour market, and it is worth

confronting and striving to overcome the postgraduate transitional struggles that have been identified in this paper so that more students and, inherently, wider society, can ultimately benefit from their education and expertise.

Conclusion

The relative omission of the transition to doctoral level study from the educational literature has largely stemmed from the social construction of doctoral students as 'experts' of HE, and the concomitant implication that their postgraduate transitions will thus be natural, straightforward and unproblematic. Rather, the literature and data presented here demonstrate that the transition to PGR education is a complex, difficult and emotional experience for most students, regardless of their intellectual capabilities. It is a transition that can be fraught with self-doubt, anxiety and bewilderment, as the doctorate entails not only a huge amount of work, but a seismic change in learning style, environment and levels of support.

The focus group data described in this paper presents a small cohort of new doctoral students who, whilst highly bright and capable, had all felt daunted, disorientated and/or insecure at some point in the early weeks and months of their doctorate. Many were particularly concerned about the onus on independent scholarship involved in the doctorate, and this significant departure from past educational experience seriously, if temporarily, displaced and confused many of the participants who felt like novices after years of mastering the more structured and familiar undergraduate and PGT formulae. As the literature suggests, 'imposter syndrome' was prevalent amongst the students, with many questioning their academic capabilities for the first time in their educational careers.

This paper also highlights the importance of both peer and staff support and involvement for settling new doctoral students. Most of the participants enjoyed positive, supportive relationships with fellow doctoral colleagues thanks to both institutional efforts to foster a sense of academic community within departments – through peer-mentoring, office-sharing and informal information and feedback exchange networks – and through students adopting a Monday-Friday, 9-5 approach to their studies. However, it is important to remember that this pattern of working does not capture everyone's doctoral experience, and students outside of this schedule can struggle to benefit from and participate in departmental communities of peers and staff. The data also reveals some continuing issues with the perception of barriers between staff and students.

Most significantly, this paper identified two key changes occurring in the postgraduate sector and environment: the aforementioned effort to build a sense of community into busy academic departments; and pressures for those students and staff working in academia to *do* and *be* more than their remit had perhaps originally implied. For staff, this includes the 'publish or perish' agenda and for doctoral students the mounting pressure to gain a wide range of employability skills on top of their thesis. All of these changes have emanated from growing state interest and involvement in the postgraduate sector, with universities under increasing pressure to improve the doctoral research environment (by building in more training, supervisory support and a sense of community) and to produce skilled knowledge workers of benefit to the economy in a timely fashion (by increasing the regulation of the doctorate and through more advanced skills training).

However, the data suggests that these two major changes have not always neatly dovetailed with one another, despite coming from the shared aim of improving the experience of doctorates in order to improve retention and completion rates. The ability for a sense of community to develop within the contemporary academic context was complicated in a number of ways for the participants, for example. First, both staff and students increasingly have less time to interact with another due to busier schedules and time pressures. Second, the rising number of doctoral students in departments can make it difficult to establish familiarity and community, particularly between doctoral students and staff, who can feel outnumbered. Lastly, negativity around the career prospects of doctoral students, and the long-term job security of academic staff, can breed negative competitiveness in small, busy and increasingly packed out

departments. Much more research attention is required to explore the effects of these changes – which look set to intensify - on both staff and doctoral students.

However, amidst the nervousness and heaped schedules, this research also revealed a powerful sense of excitement, privilege and positivity amongst doctoral students at the beginning of their doctorates. The participants were thrilled at the prospect of immersing themselves in their topics and embedding themselves in like-minded, inspirational and informative professional and social networks in the coming years. It is important that this story – of optimism, enthusiasm and good fortune – is told in research on postgraduate transitions too, and that what gets doctoral students into PGR education – their intellect, thirst for knowledge and change, hard work and enjoyment and skilful mastering of academic tasks and life – is not overlooked. The doctoral students in this study may have been daunted and anxious about their doctorates, and they may come to learn that the doctorate is not perhaps what it was, but they were also hugely excited, and felt extremely lucky, to get started. Their excitement is a useful, needed reminder that we must be careful not to just submit to narratives of negativity around doctoral students and the doctorate itself, which, whilst certainly a different shape today, remains the ultimate educational goal for many bright, hopeful and hardworking undergraduate and PGT students that it has been for centuries.

References

ABBOTT-CHAPMAN, J., 2006. Moving from technical and further education to university: an Australian study of mature students. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*. vol. 58, no. 1, pp. 1-17.
ADKINS, B., 2009. PhD pedagogy and the changing knowledge landscapes of universities. *Higher Education Research and Development*. vol. 28, no. 2, pp. 165-177.
ARTESS, J., BALL, C. and MOK, P., 2008. Higher degrees: postgraduate study in the UK 2000/01 to 2005/06. Available from:
https://www.hecsu.ac.uk/higher_degrees_postgraduate_study_in_the_uk_2000_01_to_2005_06.htm
AUNOLA, K., LESKINEN, E. and NURMI, J., 2006. Developmental dynamics between mathematics performance, task motivation, and teachers' goals during the transition to primary school. *Journal of Educational Psychology*. vol. 76, no. 1, pp. 21-40.
AUSTIN, A., 2002. Preparing the next generation of faculty: graduate school as socialization to the academic career. *The Journal of Higher Education*. vol. 73, no. 1, pp. 94-122.
BERRINGTON, A. and STONE, J., 2014. Young adults' transitions to residential independence in Britain: the role of social and housing policy. In: L. Antonucci, M. Hamilton and S. Roberts, eds. *Young People and Social Policy in Europe: Dealing with Risk, Inequality and Precarity in Times of Crisis*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 210-235.
BROOKS, R., 2002. Transitional friends? Young people's strategies to manage and maintain friendships during a period of repositioning. *Journal of Youth Studies*. vol. 5, no. 4, pp. 449-467.
BROWN, L., 2009. An ethnographic study of the friendship patterns of international students in England: an attempt to recreate home through conational interaction. *International Journal of Educational Research*. vol. 48, no. 3, pp. 184-193.
BYNNER, J., 2005. Rethinking the youth phase of the life-course: the case for emerging adulthood? *Journal of Youth Studies*. vol. 8, no. 4, pp. 367-384.
CAREERS RESEARCH AND ADVISORY CENTRE, 2013. What do researchers do? Early career progression of doctoral graduates 2013. Available from: https://www.vitae.ac.uk/vitae-publications/reports/what-do-researchers-do-early-career-progression-2013.pdf/view
CHEMERS, M.M., HU, L. and GARCIA, B.F., 2001. Academic self-efficacy and first year college student performance and adjustment. *Journal of Educational Psychology*. vol. 93, no. 1, pp. 55-64.
CHENG, M., BARNES, G.P., EDWARDS, C., VALYRAKIS, M. and CORDUNEANU, R., 2015. Transition skills and strategies: key transition skills. Available from:
http://enhancementthemes.ac.uk/enhancement-themes/current-enhancement-theme/transition-skills-phase-1

CHESTER, A., BURTON, L.J., XENOS, S. and ELGAR, K., 2013. Peer mentoring: supporting successful transitions for first year psychology undergraduate students. *Australian Journal of Psychology*. vol. 65, pp. 30-37.

CHRISTIE, H., 2009. Emotional journeys: young people and transitions to university. *Journal of Sociology and Education*. vol. 30, no. 2, pp. 123-136.

CHRISTIE, H., MUNRO, M. and WAGER, F., 2005. 'Day students' in higher education: widening access students and successful transitions to university life. *International Studies in Sociology of Education*. vol. 15, no. 1, pp. 3-29.

CLARKE, G. and LUNT, I., 2014. International comparisons in postgraduate education: quality, access and employment outcomes. Available from:
https://www.madrimasd.org/empleo/documentos/doc/International_comparisons_in_postgraduate_education-quality_access_and_employment_outcomes.pdf

CLUETT, L. and SKENE, J., 2006. Improving the postgraduate coursework student experience: barriers and the role of institution. Available from:
http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.145.5455&rep=rep1&type=pdf#pa%20ge=76

COPE-WATSON, G. and BETTS, A.S., 2010. Confronting otherness: an e-conversation between doctoral students living with Imposter Syndrome. *Canadian Journal for New Scholars in Education*. vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 1-10.

CORYELL, J.E., WAGNER, S., CLARK, M.C. and STUESSY, C., 2013. Becoming *real*: adult student impressions of developing an educational researcher identity. *Journal of Further and Higher Education*. vol. 37, no. 3, pp. 367-383.

DARWIN, A. and PALMER, E., 2009. Mentoring circles in higher education. *Higher Education Research and Development*. vol. 28, no. 2, pp. 125-136.

DECONINCK, K., 2015. Trust me, I'm a Doctor: a PhD survival guide. *The Journal of Economic Education*. vol. 46, no. 4, pp. 360-375.

DEDRICK, R. and WATSON, F., 2002. Mentoring needs of female, minority and international graduate students: a content analysis of academic research guides and related print material. *Mentoring and Tutoring*. vol. 10, no. 3, pp. 275-289.

DELAMONT, S. and ATKINSON, P., 2001. Doctoring uncertainty: mastering craft knowledge. *Social Studies of Science*. vol. 31, no. 1, pp. 87-107.

DELAMONT, S., ATKINSON, P. and PARRY, O., 2001. *Supervising the doctorate: a guide to success*. Berkshire: Open University Press.

DEPARTMENT FOR BUSINESS, INNOVATION AND SKILLS, 2013. International comparative performance of the UK research base – 2013. Available from:
https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/performance-of-the-uk-research-base-international-comparison-2013

EASTERBY-SMITH, M., THORPE, R. and LOWE, A., 2002. *Management research: an introduction*. London: Sage.

ELLISON, R. and PURCELL, K., 2015. *Addressing the research questions via FutureTrack data analysis: final report*. Warwick Institute for Employment Research.

GEIGER, R., 1997. Doctoral education: the short-term crisis vs. the long-term challenge. *The Review of Higher Education*. vol. 20, no. 3, pp. 239-251.

GEWIRTZ, S., 2008. Give us a break! A sceptical review of contemporary discourses of lifelong learning. *European Educational Research Journal*. vol. 7, no. 4, pp. 414-424.

GOLUVSHKINA, E. and MILLIGAN, C., 2012. Developing early stage researchers: employability perceptions of social science doctoral candidates. *International Journal for Researcher Development*. vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 64-78.

GOULD, J., 2015. How to build a better PhD. Available from: http://www.nature.com/news/how-to-build-a-better-phd-1.18905

GRIFFIN, M.T.Q. and NOVOTNY, J.M., 2012. *A nuts-and-bolts approach to teaching nursing*. New York: Springer.

GURR, G., 2001. Negotiating the 'rackety bridge' – a dynamic model for aligning supervisory style with research student development. *Higher Education and Development*. vol. 20, no. 1, pp. 81-92.

HAGGIS, T. and POUGET, M., 2002. Trying to be motivated: perspectives on learning from younger students accessing higher education. *Teaching in Higher Education*. vol. 7, no. 3, pp. 326-336.

HAMILTON, M.G. and ADAMSON, E., 2013. Bounded agency in young cares' life course-stage domains and transitions. *Journal of Youth Studies*. vol. 16, no. 1, pp. 101-117.

HARLEY, D., WINN, S., PEMBERTON, S. and WILCOX, P., 2007. Using texting to support students' transition to university. *Innovations in Education and Teaching International*. vol. 44, pp. 229-241.

HAYTON, J., 2015. *PhD: an uncommon guide to research, writing & PhD life*. London: James Hayton.

HEUSSI, A., 2012. Postgraduate student perceptions of the transition into postgraduate study. *Student Engagement and Experience Journal*. vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 1-13.

HIGHER EDUCATION ACADEMY/NUS SCOTLAND, 2013. Learning journeys: student experiences in further and higher education in Scotland. Available from: https://www.heacademy.ac.uk/system/files/resources/learning_journeys_2013.pdf

HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION, 2012. Postgraduate education: an independent inquiry by the Higher Education Commission. Available from: http://www.policyconnect.org.uk/hec/research/report-postgraduate-education

HOCKEY, J., 1991. The social science PhD: a literature review. *Studies in Higher Education*. vol. 16, no. 3, pp. 1-14.

HUANG, Y., 2012. Transitioning challenges faced by Chinese graduate students. *Adult Learning*. vol. 23, no. 3, pp. 138-147.

HUGHES, C. and TIGHT, M., 2013. The metaphors we study by: the doctorate as a journey and/or as work. *Higher Education Research and Development*. vol. 32, no. 5, pp. 765-775.

JANTA, H., LUGOSI, P. and BROWN, L., 2014. Coping with loneliness: a netnographic study of doctoral students. *Journal of Further and Higher Education*. vol. 38, no. 4, pp. 553-571.

JOHNSON, L., LEE, A. and GREEN, B., 2000. The PhD and autonomous self: gender, rationality and postgraduate pedagogy. *Studies in Higher Education*. vol. 25, no. 2, pp. 135-147.

KALLIO, K., KALLIO, T., TIENARI, J. and HYVONEN, T., 2016. Ethos at stake: performance management and academic work in universities. *Human Relations*. vol. 69, no. 3, pp. 685-709.

LEA, J., 2009. *Political correctness and higher education: British and American perspectives*. New York: Routledge.

LEE, A. and GREEN, B., 2009. Supervision as metaphor. *Studies in Higher Education*. vol. 34, no. 6, pp. 615-630.

LI, Y., 2015. Publish SCI papers or no degree: practices of Chinese doctoral supervisors in response to the publication pressure on science students. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*. vol. 36, no. 4, pp. 545-558.

MACARO, E. and WINGATE, U., 2004. From sixth form to university: motivation and transition among high achieving state-school language students. *Oxford Review of Education*. vol. 30, no. 4, pp. 467-488.

MARINGE, F. and GIBBS, P., 2009. *Marketing higher education: theory and practice*. Berkshire: Open University Press.

MCEWEN, L., DUCK, R., HAIGH, M., SMITH, S.J., WOLFENDEN, L. and KELLY, K., 2005. Evaluating the 'postgraduateness' of vocational taught Masters environmental courses: student perspectives. *Planet*. vol. 14, pp. 8-12.

MCPHERSON, C., PUNCH, S. and GRAHAM, E., 2017. Transitions from undergraduate to taught postgraduate study: emotion, integration and belonging. *Journal of Perspectives in Applied Academic Practice*, forthcoming.

MCMILLAN, W., 2014. 'They have different information about what is going on': emotion in the transition to university. *Higher Education Research and Development*. vol. 33, no. 6, pp. 1123-1135.

MELLORS-BOURNE, R., METCALFE, J., PEARCE, E. and HOOLEY, T., 2014. Understanding the recruitment and selection of postgraduate researchers by English higher education institutions. Available from: https://derby.openrepository.com/derby/handle/10545/326110

MENZIES, J.L. and BARON, R., 2014. International postgraduate student transition experiences: the importance of student societies and friends. *Innovations in Education and Teaching International*. vol. 51, no. 1, pp. 84-94.

MORTIMER, J.T., 2014. Transition to adulthood, parental support and early adult wellbeing: recent findings from the youth development study. In: A. Booth, ed. *Early Adulthood in a Family Context*. New York: Springer, pp. 27-34.

MULLEN, C.A., 2012. *From student to professor: translating a graduate degree into a career in academia*. Plymouth: Rowman and Littlefield Education.

O'DONNELL, V.L. and TOBBELL, J., 2007. The transition of adult students to higher education: legitimate participation in a community of practice? *Adult Education Quarterly*. vol. 57, no. 4, pp. 312-328.

O'DONNELL, V.L., TOBBELL, J., LAWTHOM, R. and ZAMMIT, M., 2009. Transition to postgraduate study: practice, participation and the widening participation agenda. *Active Learning in Higher Education.* vol. 10, no. 1, pp. 26-40.

OWLER, K., 2010. A 'problem' to be managed? Completing a PhD in the Arts and Humanities. *Arts and Humanities in Higher Education.* vol. 9, no. 3, pp. 289-304.

PETRE, M. and RUGG, G., 2010. *The unwritten rules of PhD research.* Berkshire: Open University Press.

PHILLIPS, E.M. and PUGH, D.S., 1994. *How to get a PhD: a handbook for students and their supervisors.* Buckingham: Open University Press.

ROKSA, J. and VELEZ, M., 2012. A late start: delayed entry, life course transitions and Bachelor's degree completion. *Social Forces.* vol. 90, no. 3, 769-794.

RP GROUP, 2010. Promoting the transition of high school students to college: examining effective practices. Available from: https://rpgroup.org/Portals/0/Documents/Projects/Effective%20PracticesHS/High-School-Transition-Brief_0.pdf

RYAN, J. and VIETE, R., 2009. Respectful interaction: learning with international students in the English-speaking academy. *Teaching in Higher Education.* vol. 14, no. 3, pp. 303-314.

SAMBROOK, S., STEWART, J. and ROBERTS, C., 2008. Doctoral supervision...a view from above, below and the middle! *Journal of Further and Higher Education.* vol. 31, no. 1, pp. 71-84.

SASTRY, T., 2004. *Postgraduate education in the United Kingdom.* Oxford: Higher Education Policy Institute.

SHANAHAN, M. J., 2000. Pathways to adulthood in changing societies: variability and mechanisms in life course perspective. *Annual Review of Sociology.* vol. 26, pp. 667-692.

SIRSCH, U., 2003. The impending transition from primary to secondary school: challenge or threat? *International Journal of Behavioural Development.* vol. 27, no. 5, pp. 385-395.

TAYLOR, S. and BEASLEY, N., 2005. *A handbook for doctoral supervisors.* Abingdon: Routledge.

THOMSON, P., 2008. Children and young people: voices in visual research. In: P. Thomson, ed. *Doing Visual Research with Children and Young People.* Abingdon: Routledge, pp. 1-21.

THOMSON, R., BELL, R., HOLLAND, J., HENDERSON, S., McGRELLIS, S. and SHARPE, S., 2002. Critical moments: choice, chance and opportunity in young people's narratives of transition. *Sociology.* vol. 36, no. 4, pp. 335-354.

TOBBELL, J. and O'DONNELL, V.L., 2013. Transition to postgraduate study: postgraduate ecological systems and identity. *Cambridge Journal of Education.* vol. 43, no. 1, pp. 123-138.

TOBBELL, J., O'DONNELL, V.L. and ZAMMIT, M., 2008. Exploring practice and participation in transition to postgraduate social science study. Available from: http://eprints.hud.ac.uk/7755/

TOBBELL, J., O'DONNELL, V.L. and ZAMMIT, M., 2010. Exploring transition to postgraduate study: shifting identities in interaction with communities, practice and participation. *British Educational Research Journal.* vol. 36, no. 2, pp. 261-278.

UNIVERSITY WORLD NEWS, 2012. Massification continues to transform higher education. Available from: http://www.universityworldnews.com/article.php?story=20120831155341147

VAN DER MEER, J., JANSEN, E. and TORENBEEK, M., 2010. 'It's almost a mindset that teachers need to change': first-year students' need to be introduced into time management. *Studies in Higher Education.* vol. 35, no. 7, pp. 777-791.

WAKELING, P. and KYRIACOU, C., 2010. Widening participation from undergraduate to postgraduate research degrees: a research synthesis. Available from: http://www.esrc.ac.uk/files/public-engagement/public-dialogues/full-report-widening-participation/

WALTHER, A., 2006. Regimes of youth transitions: choice, flexibility and security in young people's experiences across different European contexts. *Young.* vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 119-139.

WENGER, E., 1998. *Communities of practice: Learning, meaning and identity.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

WEST, K., 2012. Formative evaluation of the transition to postgraduate study for counselling and psychotherapy training: students' perceptions of assignments and academic writing. *Counselling and Psychotherapy Research: Linking Research with Practice.* vol. 12, no. 2, pp. 128-135.

WILLMOTT, H., 1995. Managing the academics: commodification and control in the development of university education in the UK. *Human Relations.* vol. 48, no. 9, pp. 993-1027.

WILSON, A., 1987. Research degrees and submission rates. In: ESRC, ed. *The Social Science PhD: The ESRC Inquiry on Submission Rates.* London: ESRC, pp. 161-178.

WISKER, G., 2012. *The good supervisor.* Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan.

WISKER, G., ROBINSON, G., TRAFFORD, V., CREIGHTON, E. and WARNES, M., 2003. Recognising and overcoming dissonance in postgraduate student research. *Studies in Higher Education.* vol. 28, no. 1, pp. 91-105.

WISKER, G., MORRIS, C., WARNES, M., LILLY, M., ROBINSON, G., TRAFFORD, V. and CHENG, M., 2009. Doctoral learning journeys: supporting and enhancing doctoral students' research and related skills development through research evidence-based practices. *Assessment, Learning & Teaching Journal.* vol. 5, pp. 19-22.

YARWOOD-ROSS, L. and HAIGH, R., 2014. As others see us: what PhD students say about supervisors. *Nurse Researcher.* vol. 22, no. 1, pp. 38-43.

YOUNG, K., FOGARTY, M.P. and MCRAE, S., 1987. *The management of doctoral studies in the social sciences.* London: PSI.

Louise Bennett: On Writing the Creole Community, Poetically

Aileen S.B. Lobban[1]
University of Stirling, aileen.lobban@stir.ac.uk

Abstract: Louise Bennett wrote in the Creole – by doing so, she claimed the maternal language of her nation community, and subverted not only the hegemony of the patriarchal society but also the historical colonial dominance over her colonised race. By reimagining the "marginalised" status of a colonised island as a singular community itself, I present various arguments. Firstly, Bennett's writing career spans pre and post Jamaican independence and her works provide a unique social commentary of the sub/culture of the Jamaican people, in their own "bastardised" language. Bennett's use of the Creole allows the Jamaican people to claim their own identity under colonial power. I will be referring in this article to Bennett's two poetry collections, *Selected Poems*[2] and *Jamaica Labrish*.[3] Secondly, this is balanced by an exploration of her extensive use of Jamaican proverbs in her work – proverbs embody the 'distillation of generations'[4] affording a communal, didactic approach to the Jamaican cultural heritage. Thirdly, her influence continues in the diaspora, particularly in the Dub poets who slide on the Creole continuum for popular accessibility but who acknowledge the debt to Bennett for her orality and her vision to gain credibility and an identity for the "submerged" Jamaican voice.

Key words: Jamaica, Louise Bennett, Jamaican Creole, colonial dominance, female Caribbean writers, Jamaican proverbs, dub poets,

---

[1] I would like to thank Dr. Gemma Robertson for her continued insightful support. I would also like to thank the editors, peer reviewers, and advisors of *Spark*, for this opportunity.

[2] Louise Bennett, *Selected Poems,* edited by Mervyn Morris, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1983; repr.2005)

[3] Louise Bennett, *Jamaica Labrish,* with notes and introduction by Rex Nettleford, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1966; repr.1973-1995)

[4] Bennett, Louise, 'Introduction', *Selected Poems,* edited by Mervyn Morris (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1983; repr.2005), p.

'I have been set apart by other creative writers a long time ago because of the language that I speak and work in – from the beginning nobody recognised me as a writer.'[5]

It takes a very special lady to move from an "unacknowledged" status as a writer to one of acclaimed national Jamaican hero – but that is what Louise Bennett achieved. Throughout her substantial corpus of work – textual and performative – Bennett exclusively wrote in the Creole. By doing so, Bennett not only challenged the privileged status accorded to the poetic tradition of white discourse in Caribbean letters, she empowered the voices and expression of the Jamaican people. Her use of oral and scribal forms as she refashioned the language to express the poetic sentiments of the people, was an important breakthrough in Caribbean literature.[6] It allowed the Jamaican people to find their sense of worth and identity through their own native voice – 'Language is an index of power and identity. If we think our language is unworthy we think ourselves unworthy'.[7] Bennett's work was a unique contribution to Caribbean literature and a truly distinctive voice within the canon. She claimed the maternal language of her nation community, and subverted not only the hegemony of the patriarchal society but also the historic colonial dominance of her colonised race. Her use of the Creole allowed the Jamaican people to assert their own identity under colonial power. Through the voices of and within her poetry, which will be the textual frame for this article, Bennett stressed the importance of the Creole language as a creative practice that reimagines and experiences social opposition and social accommodation. In this article I will be encompassing this collective identity of the Jamaican people to embody "community" by reimagining the "marginalised" status of a colonised island as a singular community itself; but equally I will approach the Creole language, used by Bennett, as itself determining a community identifier, where communities are sites of exchange and evolution and in which these connections are translated in a variety of forms. The use of Creole language – a hybrid language created under the regime of a dominant colonial society – is therefore seen as a powerful signifier of a submerged spirit of resistance and subversiveness.[8] Translatability can be read as a horizontal action across borders, cultures and languages; arguably, Bennett's use of the Creole constitutes one form of language layered under another i.e. the Creole is placed subversively and vertically underneath Standard English. Not only does Bennett use the Creole to undermine the position of the colonial Standard English, but she drills down into her own culture to mine the wealth of oral folklore of her heritage, highlighted specifically in this article by her use of proverbs. Her poetry also drills into the heart of her culture to present a communal "writing." In essence, she engages a community of readers/audiences in a Creole conversation.

---

[5] 'Interview with Louise Bennett', *Caribbean Quarterly*, quoted in Edward Kamau Brathwaite, *History of the Voice: The Development of Nation Language in Anglophone Caribbean Poetry,* (London, Port of Spain: New Beacon Books, 1984), p.27

[6] *Caribbean Women Writers*, edited by Selwyn. R Cudjoe, (Wellesley, MA: Calaloux, 1990), p.27

[7] Ian Boyne, *Sunday Gleaner*, Aug 5, 2012
https://jamaicagleaner.com/gleaner/20120805/focus/focus1.html

[8] Jahan Ramazani, *The Hybrid Muse*, (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2001)

There are three areas in which Bennett embeds the notion of community in her poetic identity and works; firstly the use of the maternal language to create a space for a communal Jamaican identity; secondly, her use of proverbs which widens the scope for a broader interpretation of community by tapping into generational wisdom; and thirdly, how her influence in the oral use of the Creole, i.e.in performance, translates outwards to a diasporic presence exemplified here by the Dub poets such as Lillian Allen and mandiela.

Turning first to an examination of the socio/political and cultural impact of Bennett's choice in using the Creole, a complex picture arises. At the time that Bennett was writing there was a perceived lack of dignity in the Creole speech, "distorted" as it were by the "bastardising" effect of colonisation. This arguably deflects the reader from the complexities and meanings behind Bennett's poetry, with the truth of her observations being submerged within the dialectic. The Kenyan writer and critic, Ngugi wa Thiong'o succinctly and powerfully draws our attention to the way in which language can convey particular ideological presences and absences within the colonial context. In his words, language is a carrier of people's culture. Culture is a carrier of people's values. Values are a carrier of people's outlook or consciousness and this sense of identity. So, by destroying or under developing people's languages, the colonizing nations were deliberately killing or under developing the cultures, values and consciousness of the people. And by imposing their languages, they were also imposing the culture, values and consciousness carried by them. It was this that Bennett rigidly opposed, despite drawing scorn and "non-acknowledgment" for the first part of her career as not being a "proper" writer, only "doing" dialect. Bennett's epiphany about using the dialect, a language she was surrounded by, came when she boarded a tramcar one day. She heard the market women exclaim:

> Pread out yuhself deh Liza, one
> Dress –oman dah look like she
> She see de li space side a we
> And waan foce herself een deh[9]

This can be read literally as the market women making no room for a woman such as Bennett i.e. of middle class; equally it can be read metaphorically as making no room for the Anglophone language associated with those not from the working class – i.e. squeezing out the nation language. Despite being colonially educated, Bennett chose from that moment to write exclusively in her own dialect. If we look at the issues of representation here, we can see that Bennett's work shows she chooses 'nation language' at a crucial time. She cannot speak for the nation. Instead her practice is one of listening to the multiple voices of her culture/community and then reimagining them/dramatizing them within a quite strict form

---

[9] Louise Bennett, 'In the tramcar', *Miss Lulu Sez*, (Kingston: Gleaner Co, 1949), pp.150-151

of poetry. This form allows a range of readings – readings that can include national allegory where a poem about a streetcar becomes a poem about Jamaica, class and language, but which also enable a range of voices to be performed and thus be interpreted widely. Bennett's social contribution is not just recording or representing voice accurately, it is also about reframing it for critique.

The Mother Tongue, although nationalistic, is perceived as a female concept – that of learning the first language at the mother's knee. This language remains 'at the centre of one's being' even after other languages have been learned and it is this that Bennett taps into by her exclusive use of the Creole.[10] She is communicating at the first basic level, that of child/ daughter and mother. This relationship is vital for the transference of knowledge and culture within a community. It was Kristeva who claimed that the semiotic potential of language is subversive and displaces the hegemony of the paternal/symbolic.[11] This is indeed what Bennett achieves with her use of the mother tongue. She absorbs the fundamental argument that the poetic use of the mother tongue in effect recovers the maternal body linguistically, and subverts and displaces paternal law. In other words, Bennett recovers the maternal presence of musicality and rhythm within her Creole poetry, and subversively displaces the structured colonial order of the patriarchal language. Brathwaite makes the same point that by using the Creole Bennett was, in fact, being subversive and that she was effectively undermining the power of the coloniser.[12] Bennett was perceived as non-partisan (despite being closely involved with the Manleys in her personal life.) But her poetry provides a perceptive, often biting, social commentary, underpinned by the subversively determined choice of the communal language. She spoke for the people of Jamaica redirecting the inverse relationship of coloniser and colonised – refracting the truth to 'tun history upside dung.'[13] So doing, she created a "linguistic" community for the marginalised people of the island state – a writing that effectively identified her own community of Jamaica. By using the Creole she afforded communication within her own community to the exclusion of others, socially and politically.

 Turning to her poetry – Bennett was perfectly placed, with her writing career spanning pre- and post-independence, to provide a unique social commentary of the sub/culture of the Jamaican people in their own "bastardised" language. Her poetry became the voice **of** and **for** the people, dealing with the topical, everyday life of Jamaicans. Bennett's urban poems vividly describe aspects of life in Kingston of an earlier period, (she was not just Jamaican-centred but Kingston-centred) Her streets scenes are enhanced by

---

[10] Giselle Anatol, 'Speaking in (M)Other Tongues: The Role of Language in Jamaica Kincaid's "The Autobiography of My Mother"', *Callaloo,* Vol. 25. No.3, (Johns Hopkins University Press, Summer 2002), p.940

[11] Judith Butler, 'The Body Politics of Julia Kristeva', *Hypatia*, Vol.3. No.3, *(*Winter 1989), p.108

[12] Edward Kamau Brathwaite, *History of the Voice*, (London, Port of Spain: New Beacon Books, 1984)

[13] Katherine Verhagen Rodis, 'Vernacular Literacy and Formal Analysis: Louise Bennett-Coverley's Jamaican English Verse', *Journal of West Indian Literature*, Vol. 18. No.1, (November 2009), p.65

characters such as the street peddler in 'South Parade Peddler', crying out her wares, or the candy seller soliciting passers-by, in 'Candy Seller'.

> 'South Parade Peddler'
>
> Hairnet, scissors, fine teeth comb!
>
> Wey de nice lady dey?
>
> Buy a scissors from me lady?
>
> Hair pin? Toot pase? Goh Wey!
>
> Me say go-weh already, if
>
> Yuh doan like it see me.
>
> Yuh dah swell like bombin plane fun'
>
> Yuh soon bus up like Graff Spe. [14]

The street cries of a South Parade Peddler are seldom heard today as they (the peddlers) are now "respectably" perched behind Corporation stalls which control their movements and save passers-by from old time peddler persuasion. (paratext from Rex Nettleford attached to each poem)

> 'Candy Seller'
>
> Candy lady, candy mam?
>
> Bizniz bad now-a-days.
>
> Lady wid de pretty lickle bwoy
>
> Buy candy, Gwan yuh ways!
>
> Yuh right fe draw de pickney han,
>
> Koo pon him nost hole,
>
> Him y'eye dem a-tare out like him want
>
> Hickmatize me candy-bole. [15]

The professional salesman – charm of the local candy seller can easily turn into abusive, if humorous, anger against the reluctant or unwilling customer, The "abusive asides" are a kind of stock in trade in the sorority of candy-sellers. (Rex Nettleford)

Equally, Bennett's wartime poems are undoubtedly dated by their topicality but contextually still have much to say about the Jamaican culture. Britain went to war and as a colonial state so did Jamaica.

---

[14] Louise Bennett, *Jamaica Labrish,* with notes and introduction by Rex Nettleford, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1966; repr.1973-1995) p.27

[15] Louise Bennett, *Jamaica Labrish,* with notes and introduction by Rex Nettleford, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1966; repr.1973-1995) p.28

Although it was distanced from it, the war had its effects – there were important by-products for the ordinary man and woman, such as the recruitment of Jamaican labour (much of it unemployed at the time) to meet the shortage of male farm labour in the US, which had by 1942 become fully engaged in WW2. The exposure of Jamaicans to American consumer goods through contacts at the base showed the extent to which people' lives were dominated by the events. The shortage of food supplies, price controls and the attendant profiteering by merchants and shopkeepers are vividly recorded by Bennett.

 A close analysis of three stanzas of a single poem about food purchasing, 'Wartime Grocery' illustrates Bennett's poetic expertise at obliquely and succinctly commenting on issues within her community – those of inequality of race, class and gender:

> Jackass say de worl' noh level
> Koo how Miss Pan she fat!
> She noh need milk, wen me side o' her
> Me fava mawga rat! [16]

The proverb incorporated in this poem is 'Jackass say worl not level' – the simple meaning of this particular proverb is that there is no equality, no fairness. The poem itself talks about the hardships facing the Jamaican people in wartime, and the fact that the shopkeepers exploited the food shortage by marrying commodities together to sell a commodity that was harder to sell with one that was in demand. For instance, flour was "married" to cornmeal, salt-pork to mackerel. One commodity which was especially scarce was milk and this is the immediate context to which Bennett applies the proverb – she comments on how it is unfair that the rich, who are well fed and thriving, do not need milk but can obtain it, whilst the poorer people cannot obtain it but need it. The main point to notice here is that the shape of this one stanza mirrors the stratification of the Jamaican class system from rich down to poor, overarched by a general comment provided by the weight of the proverb in the following manner:

'Jackass say de worl' noh level' – this proverbial statement contextualises the stanza by making a generalisation of inequality pertaining to a wider group – in this case the Jamaican people. It creates a broad arc for the stanza which then narrows down into a specific group. 'Koo how Miss Pam she fat!' – this next line names a single person who is identified with the richer class of people i.e. one that is fat in times of scarcity of food. Bennett embodies a group identity in a singled out and named persona. Therefore, Miss Pam represents the rich in this poem. 'She noh need milk, wen me side o' her' – the irony here is that Miss Pam does not need milk because she is comfortable but can get it – this comments on the fact that the richer classes are not suffering. The balance of the line, created by the comma, highlights the comparison that is about to come. 'Me fava mawga rat!' – This last line contains the punch: the

---

[16] Louise Bennett, *Jamaica Labrish,* with notes and introduction by Rex Nettleford, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1966; repr.1973-1995) p.83

speaker is like a thin rat next to Miss Pam. The placement of the word 'rat' at the end of the last line emphasises the status of the speaker within the stratification of the stanza. The fact that the speaker (presumably female) is unnamed infers that the lower, poorer classes are unimportant.

The speaker belongs in this poorer class who are struggling with the exploitation of the retailers who, in turn, are manipulating the situation for their own gain. It is this injustice that the stanza replies to, with the proverb at the start announcing Bennett's response.

The theme of "marrying" commodities is continued in stanza 7 of the poem 'Wartime Grocery' where Bennett writes that:

> Sometim you kean get wite-grain rice
> 'cep you buy de brown-grain one,
> Now dem mix up de two togedda
> You can guess how it tan![17]

This is clearly an allegory for the mixing of races of brown and white, which also, in Jamaica, reflects the hierarchical view of race and class – white/brown and black as the lowest denominator. Arguably it could also be extended to an allegory of the interplay between the masculine and feminine (the brown rice representing the male, the white the female) i.e. the interplay of the patriarchal and the matriarchal systems in the Jamaican environment.

> For brown –grain rice is very loud,
> You can smell it from afar!
> Wen dem a bwile, de good an bad snell
> Jus a play tug-o'war![18]

Inscribed into the meaning is the morality of good and bad – this alludes to the stereotypical reading of the patriarchal domination of the women and in the face of this, Bennett suggests that there could be a tug of war for power/equality. Equally, the allegory may also allude to the class system of white rice being the pure and preferred rice (the rich) and the brown being the coarser, less good rice (the poor.) Notably then, the suggestion of mixing them together now merges race and class and gender within the same complex allegory within this poem through which Bennett critiques the socio- political environment, albeit opaquely. The intersections within this poem of race and gender further highlights the need to

---

[17] Louise Bennett, *Jamaica Labrish,* with notes and introduction by Rex Nettleford, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1966; repr.1973-1995) p.83. lls.24-28

[18] Ibid. lls.29-32

account for multiple grounds of identity when considering how the social world is constructed.[19]

As noted, Bennett was supremely placed to be writing over this time period. Independence of course did not arrive to Jamaica in a vacuum – there were earlier attempts at federations, but the island got its independence in 1962 and while Jamaica celebrated, Bennett wrote a trio of poems entitled 'Jamaican Elevate', 'Independence dignity', and 'Independence' (note the pun on "dance".) These three poems showed that Bennett had grave concerns that Jamaica was ready for independence. Whilst she was larger than any political party – Ian Byrne in Sunday Gleaner 2006 notes that 'Louise Bennett was non partisan in a way that was mystifying, She mastered the art of discretion and control of the tongue' – her concern for the political implications can be seen in the following excerpts:

> 'Independence'
> Independance wid a vengeance!
> Independance raisin'cain!
> Jamaica start grow beard, ah hope
> We chin can stan'de strain![20]

The implications of the new won status were to show themselves much clearer six months later and Bennett declares this position unequivocally in the poem 'Jamaica Elevate'

> We sen we Delegation
> Over to United Nation
> An we meck OAS know dat (organisation of American states)
> We gwine join dem.
> We tell Russia we don't like dem
> We tell Englan, we naw beg dem
> An we mek 'Merica know
> We is behine dem!

Then she becomes irreverent in her "send up" of the search for an identity as expressed in her poem about the appointment of the first native Governor General

> We owna Governor General

---

[19] Kimberley Crenshaw, 'Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color', *Stanford Law Review,* Vol, 43. No.6, (July 1991).

[20] Louise Bennett, *Jamaica Labrish,* with notes and introduction by Rex Nettleford, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1966; repr.1973-1995), p.169

A true – born Native son;

Don't you member Bada John – john?

Well, him faba him can't done [21]

Bennett outlines in these three poems how Jamaicans could identify themselves with the new Independence (i.e. Jamaican) regime but expresses her concern by pointing out the irony. This idea is explored by Ramazani as 'the hybridity of double consciousness of irony' – Bennett couches her message in humour against the colonisers, but also pokes fun at her own people as the colonised; the double consciousness of not only the "marginalised" writer but the duality of the function of humour is shown here. In the eye of independence, in 1966, she wrote her most referenced poem 'Colonisation in Reverse':

What a joyful news, Miss Mattie

I feel like me heart gwine burs'

Jamaican people colonizin

Englan in reverse.

What a islan! What a people!

Man an woman, old an youn

Jusa pack dem bag and baggage

An tun history upside dung! [22]

She uses humour to poke fun at, almost ridicule the whole idea of colonisation. Underneath of course lies a critical eye of observation which deals with the migrant Jamaican to the promised lands of US or UK. As noted, her incisive social observations were couched in humour. Bennett believed in laughter in the face of adversity 'I have found a medium through which I can pretend to be laughing' Louise Bennett says – this continues: 'otherwise I would weep'.[23] She had to find a way to be heard, writing as she did in the Creole, and equally as a woman in this traditionally, historically patriarchal and "submerged" nation. Black laughter was one of the chief mechanisms used during and after slavery to undermine the power of the coloniser and this is what Bennett taps into. As Morris notes, the laughter is of two distinguishable, though often intermingling kinds: the laughter of sympathetic comedy and the laughter of satire. Satire seeks to reform or to destroy by ridicule; through often not obviously angry it often implies something

---

[21] Louise Bennett, *Jamaica Labrish,* with notes and introduction by Rex Nettleford, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1966; repr.1973-1995), p.174

[22] Louise Bennett, *Selected Poems,* edited by Mervyn Morris, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1983; repr.2005) p.117

[23] Louise Bennett and Dennis Scott, 'Bennett on Bennett', interview, *Caribbean Quarterly*, 14, nos. 1 and 2 (1968), p.97

akin to anger. In sympathetic comedy, on the other hand, there is generous acceptance of foibles.[24] Bennett inverts the balance and, through laughter, places the native language at the centre of her poetry, deliberately recentering the power to the colonised – 'When you look between the lines you find all the sorrow there and all the facts too, but if you don't search for it, well then you won't find it'.[25]

 Turning now to Bennett's use of proverbs we see how she creates a bridge between the past and the present; 'After all, proverbs are the poetry of the people'.[26]

'One could say that there is a 'story behind every proverb. Proverbs are speech acts with text, texture and context that have a noteworthy impact on oral and written communication within a culture and society'.[27]

Bennett was aware of the importance of folkloristic material as a means of capturing essential truths relating to a/her community and the authoritative voice which folklore holds, including the importance of preserving and collecting proverbs. Proverbs are 'the distillation of generations'[28] and afford a communal didactic approach to the Jamaican cultural heritage. Proverbial poetry is informed by social experience and practice, and for Bennett it enables a non-partisan critique of those experiences and practices. Prahlad's holistic understanding is of the proverb as 'a lived part of the culture'.[29] Bennett superimposes onto her own poetic and cultural commentaries this aspect (identified here by Prahlad) of a traditional "living culture" which is embodied in the proverbs and thus she creates a double layer to her commentary: the layer of the present, and the inherited layer of the past. Many scholars have addressed the aspect of communality latent in proverbs and Bennett hooks her poetry (and monologues) to this sense of communal group identity. Early on in the paremiological debate Taylor identified that 'proverbs belong to many people, are ingenious in form and idea, and are used as a source of wisdom and moral advice based on experience, often used to teach the younger generations'.[30]   Dundes, the unparalleled folklore scholar,

---

[24] Louise Bennett, 'Introduction', *Selected Poems,* edited by Mervyn Morris, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1983; repr.2005) p. xxiv

[25] Ibid. Introduction, p. xvii

[26] Wolfgang Mieder, *So Many Heads, So Many Wits An Anthology of English Proverb Poetry*, edited by Janet Sobiesky and Wolfgang Mieder, (Burlington, VT: Queen City Printers, 2005) intro. xiv

[27] Wolfgang Mieder, *Behold the Proverbs of a People: Proverbial Wisdom in Culture, Literature, and Politics*, (Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, 2014), p.

[28] Louise Bennett, 'Introduction', *Selected Poems,* edited by Mervyn Morris, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1983; repr.2005) p. xxiv

[29] Michael Kuelker, "A life in Proverbs: an interview with Anand Prahlad," African American Review, Vol 43. No 4 (John Hopkins University Press, 2009) p. 657

[30] Archie Taylor, 'The Wisdom of Many and the Wit of One', *The Wisdom of Many, Essays on the Proverb*, edited by Wolfgang Mieder and Alan Dundes, (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, [1981] 1994), p.3.

further identifies that 'there is an important connection between the concept of identity and folklore'.[31] He cites Bauman's claim that 'folklore is a function of shared identity.' A member of such group would know the common core of the traditions of the group and therefore create part of their own and the group's identity. This becomes an important narrative in the discourse of intersectionality of gender, race and class which underlies Bennett's poetic and proverbial work in terms of identity politics within a subculture. Through the element of proverbial usage, Bennett stabilises the shared needs and the identity of a/her own community. Inclusiveness and exclusiveness is part of any process of identity construction: it is through the knowledge of the self and the discovery of the others that an individual develops a feeling of belongingness and security.

An example of a strongly orientated proverbial poem where two proverbs frame the catalogue of hardship is a poem called 'Dutty Tough', a gritty poem about poverty and subsistence that lower-class Jamaican people endured. Stanza one starts with these proverbs:

> Sun a shine but tings noh bright
> Doah pot a bwile, bickle noh nuff
> River flood but water scarce yaw
> Ran a fall but dutty tuff!

This is then echoed in the final stanza with an interesting inflection:

> Sun a shine and pot a bwile, but
> Tings noh bright, bickle noh nuff!
> Rain a fall, river dah- flood, but
> Wata scarce and dutty tuff. [32]

The inversions here present the catalogue of each element slightly differently which stresses effectively the fact that no matter what, wages may rise but the price and hardship of living continues to take its toll – metaphorically, the ground remains hard even if the river floods and there is never enough water to sustain a livelihood. Notably the use of the Creole words, "bickle" (food) and "dutty" (ground) challenges the reader to understand the meaning of the words – this highlights the tension between speakers of Standard English and those who speak the Jamaican dialect. The use of such localised dialectal vocabulary personalises the crisis to the Jamaican people whom it is affecting and references the historical divide between the coloniser and the colonised. For Bennett, not only the use of the Creole but the use of proverbs reinforces the existence of group identities within societies.

---

[31] Alan Dundes, *Folklore Matters*, (Knoxville, TN: University of Tennessee Press,1996), p.7

[32] Louise Bennett, *Selected Poems,* edited by Mervyn Morris, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1983; repr.2005) p.27

Bennett also takes a plural, allegorical approach to proverbial imagery: consider for instance, 'dog a sweat but long hair hide I'. This proverb, found in 'My Dream', refers to a washerwoman's subversive thoughts of discontent/ rebellion at having to wash Rose's clothes, where Rose operates as an allegory for England. The poem can be read within the context of the Jamaican nationalistic desire for self-government in 1947, as well as internal class conflict within Jamaica.

> Dog a sweat but long hair hide I'
> Mout a laugh but heart a leap
> Everythin wha shine noh gole piece
> An me jump out o me sleep. [33]

 The reality inscribed here is the fact of a working woman's subservience to the richer woman in washing her clothes i.e. the position of Jamaica to Britain. The dream is for independence. As Cooper states: This sublimatory use of proverbs in a potentially explosive context of class antagonism is an excellent example of Bennett's linguistic subterfuge, indirection as a strategy to preserve psychic equilibrium.[34]

One final point to note is that with the inclusion of proverbs, Bennett is drawing attention to the importance of writing memory – i.e. she is calling on members of her community to keep them remembered and in current use. The collective memory of a community constitutes the heart of the community and Bennett's repeated use of proverbs reinforces this commonality and aligns with the central element of generational memory.

Having looked at the behaviour of the maternal language that Bennett chooses to use, at the specifics of Bennett's complex and culturally underscored poetry, and the communal use of proverbs to hook onto the inherited wisdom of generations, I now want to open the discussion to look at Bennett's diasporic influence. Her locally centred focus now finds another space transnationally in a conversation between communities, translated as it were through the Dub poets.

The dubs themselves slide on the Creole continuum for popular accessibility but they acknowledge the debt to Bennett for her orality and her vision to gain credibility and an identity for the "submerged" Jamaican voice. Like Bennett's work, this is a form of poetry which is not elite but emerges out of the people's need for a voice, a form of communication and connection, going back to the African tradition of preacher-teacher and the everyday form of language. It is meant to disrupt traditional discourse, to call

---

[33] Louise Bennett, *Jamaica Labrish,* with notes and introduction by Rex Nettleford, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1966; repr.1973-1995) p.155

[34] Carolyn Cooper, *Noises in the Blood: Orality, Gender and the "Vulgar" Body of Jamaican Popular Culture*, (London: Macmillan Education, 1993)

attention to the form of speech which is ignored in middle class colonial life and 'call the system to account' [35] Allen states that 'without two remarkable figures of the twentieth century, Louise Bennett and Bob Marley, there would be no dub poetry'.[36] She acknowledges Bennett's influence in her collection of poems entitled *Tribute to Miss Lou*, for instance the poem 'Heartbeat' which echoes the lines at the start of Bennett's poem commented on at the start of this article – 'Pred out yuself Miss Lou……….'. [37] Here Allen invites Bennett (not the market women) to take the metaphorical space at the back of the tram and therefore mark the status of the Creole language and to spread the message out.

> She writes
> the heartbeat of our lives
> dignity/culture/politics/history/ lovingness/soul
> dis dressup oman wi shinning star.[38]

> Sometimes in this dimness
> A flicker
> A light
> A path
> A Miss Lou. [39]

As noted, Miss Lou campaigned to legitimise the use of the "nation language" and by doing so she created a base for the dub poets to build on. She effectively raised it to a level of oral art form which the dubs copied and continued to shape. It is the sound of the spoken word that is the central aspect of live performance, the sound of the word which gives rise to musical riddim, the central formative aspect of the dub.[40] The sound becomes power and power is a concrete force leading to action. Differing from Bennett, action for the Dub community is first and foremost political, resistant and for the Canadian dub poets such as Allen, a feminist's tool. Together the dub poets presented a united and global political and cultural presence, greater than one individual. One might say that at the height of their popularity they created a global dub – symphony connecting the whole spectrum of Caribbean aesthetics. However, Habekost points out that academics hesitantly accepted Dub poetry into the nascent canon of Caribbean

---

[35] Lillian Allen, 'What is Dub Poetry?', uploaded by Different Knowings, (Youtube, 2 Sept 2011), < https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nWrvzUMc2aI>

[36] Lillian Allen, quoted in Ric Knowles, 'To be Dub, Female and Black: Towards a Wombancentred Afro-Caribbean Diasporic Performance Aesthetic in Toronto', *Theatre Research in Canada*, Vol 33. No. 1, (2012), footnote 13, p.99

[37] Lillian Allen, *Women Do This Every Day*, (Toronto: Women's Press of Canada, 1993), p.43, l.1

[38] Lillian Allen, *Women Do This Every Day*, (Toronto: Women's Press of Canada, 1993) p.43, lls.10-13

[39] Lillian Allen, *Women Do This Every Day*, (Toronto: Women's Press of Canada, 1993) p.43.lls 7-11

[40] Christian Habekost, *Verbal Riddim: The Politics and Aesthetics of Afro Caribbean Dub Poetry,* (Amsterdam: Rodolpi, 1993)

literature since the voice of the ghetto was still perceived as undeserving.[41]   Following this, practitioners and the academic critics have debated the future of the dub genre. More than forty years after Bennett worked to justify the value and reception of the dialect, the dubs were also faced with this complex reception concerning the populist/ low standard of the language, the revolutionary stance against the establishment and the antagonism between the oral and the written outcome. For Kei Miller the dub genre is merely a whisper now – 'the early dub poetry had a great sound, a mighty fury, today dub poetry makes a faint sound – yet it is a poetry we can identify with and should remember'.[42]One later poet, closer still to Bennett in essence, is mandiela. (mandiela associates capital letters with oppressive hierarchy, so in deference to that I adhere to that constant)[43] mandiela states that 'her biggest influence was miss lou and the early dub poets and her own roots in Jamaican pantomime'.[44] I suggest that Bennett's creative legacy translates this far particularly in the shared importance mandiela lays on the mythological heritage of Jamaica. mandiela echoes Bennett's conviction to hold onto the mythology and the shared history of black heritage and the performative style out with text, as well as championing the Creole language. mandiela's dub theatre/ choreopoem genre is one form that is at once contemporary and traditional, evolving directly from an amalgam of historic African culture. Her play, *dark diaspora in dub* gives a medium through which the black migrant community can express itself, in a sub culture of multiplicity.

  so I crammed my past/life/present
    foreign/future into fresh fake leather…..

     don't….shake your feet
     dirt proves home is/
     not a fig-
     ment of your dreams
     & too, customs will dig.[45]

One final point is to place Bennett in her own time and her own space. Ten years ago, Morris noted that 'West Indian literature, as a body of work, was a fairly recent phenomenon …. and that the flow of West Indian literature becomes fairly substantial (only) from 1952.'[46] The concept of West Indian literature has expanded rapidly from then on to the point that from the 90s onwards it has been taken for granted that

---

[41] Christian Habekost, *Verbal Riddim: The Politics and Aesthetics of Afro Caribbean Dub Poetry,* p.6

[42] *The Gleaner*, May 10, 2013, <Jamaica-gleaner.com/gleaner/2013051/ent4.html>

[43] Susan Gingell, 'jumping in heart first: an interview with ahdri zhina mandiela', *Postcolonial Text*, Vol. 2. No. 4, (2006)

[44] Ibid, p.2

[45] mandiela, ahdri zhina, *Dark Diaspora in Dub*, (Toronto: Black Woman and Woman of Colour Press, 1991), pp 24; 25

[46] Mervyn Morris, *Making West Indian Literature*, (Kingston and Miami, FL: Ian Randle Publishers, 2005)

works of merit are now written in Creole. Morris again notes that 'it is all too easy to talk about the change in attitudes as though one was never part of the colonial situation and its ways of seeing'.[47] Bennett was a forerunner for this change of attitude, a visionary who moved acceptance and cultural knowledge forward by valorising Jamaican culture and showing that the Creole can be a legitimate language of literary art. She contributed to the "process" that Brathwaite describes as 'the cultural process of creolisation in which various elements intermingle, to become the tentative cultural norm of the society'.[48] Her own society, her community, was always at the heart of Bennett's works and her own persona; despite travelling and finally migrating abroad, she insisted that her cultural (and communal) identity always travelled with her, 'Any which part mi live – Toronto –o! London-o! Florida – o!   - a Jamaica mi deh!'[49]

---

[47] Ibid, p.5

[48] Edward Kamau Brathwaite, *Contradictory Omen*, (Kingston: Savacou Publications, 1974), p.6

[49] 'Wherever I live ---- I am in Jamaica', *Miss Lou and Friends*, taped March 27, 1990 (Distributed by Reckford Films Limited, 4 Coolshade Drive, Kingston 19, Jamaica)

References

ALLEN. LILLIAN, *Women Do This Every Day*, (Toronto: Women's Press of Canada, 1993)

ANATOL. GISELLE, 'Speaking in (M)Other Tongues: The Role of Language in Jamaica Kincaid's "The Autobiography of My Mother"', *Callaloo,* Vol. 25. No.3, (Johns Hopkins University Press, Summer 2002), pp.938 – 953

BENNETT. LOUISE, *Selected Poems,* edited by Mervyn Morris, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1983; repr.2005)

BENNETT. LOUISE, *Jamaica Labrish,* with notes and introduction by Rex Nettleford, (Kingston: Sangster's Book Stores, 1966; repr.1973-1995)

BENNETT. LOUISE and SCOTT. DENNIS, 'Bennett on Bennett', interview, *Caribbean Quarterly*, 14, nos. 1 and 2 (1968), pp.97-101

BRATHWAITE. EDWARD KAMAU, *History of the Voice*, (London, Port of Spain: New Beacon Books, 1984)

BRATHWAITE. EDWARD KAMAU, *Contradictory Omen*, (Kingston: Savacou Publications, 1974),

BUTLER. JUDITH, 'The Body Politics of Julia Kristeva', *Hypatia*, Vol.3. No.3, *(*Winter 1989) pp.104-118

COOPER. CAROLYN, *Noises in the Blood: Orality, Gender and the "Vulgar" Body of Jamaican Popular Culture*, (London: Macmillan Education, 1993)

CRENSHAW. KIMBERLE, 'Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence against Women of Color', *Stanford Law Review,* Vol, 43. No.6, (July 1991), pp.1241-1299

CUDJOE. SELWYN R, *Caribbean Women Writers*, (Wellesley, MA: Calaloux, 1990)

DUNDES. ALAN, *Folklore Matters*, (Knoxville, TN: University of Tennessee Press,1996)

HAMEKOST. CHRISTIAN, *Verbal Riddim: The Politics and Aesthetics of Afro Caribbean Dub Poetry,* (Amsterdam: Rodolpi, 1993)

 KUELKER.MICHAEL, "A life in Proverbs: an interview with Anand Prahlad," *African American Review, Vol 43. No 4,* (John Hopkins University Press, 2009)

MANDIELA. AHDRI ZHINA, *Dark Diaspora in Dub*, (Toronto: Black Woman and Woman of Colour Press, 1991)

MIEDER. WOLFGANG, 'So Many Heads, So Many Wits: An Anthology of English Proverb Poetry, edited by Janet Sobieski and Wolfgang Mieder, (Burlington, VT: Queen City Printers 2005)

MIEDER. WOLFGANG, *Behold the Proverbs of a People: Proverbial Wisdom in Culture, Literature, and Politics*, (Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, 2014)

MORRIS, MERVYN, *Making West Indian Literature*, (Kingston and Miami, FL: Ian Randle Publishers, 2005)

PRAHLAD. ANAND, *African American Proverbs in Context* (Jackson, MS: University Press of Mississippi, 1996)

RAMAZANI. JAHAN, *The Hybrid Muse*, (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2001)

RODIS. KATHERINE VERHAGEN, 'Vernacular Literacy and Formal Analysis: Louise Bennett-Coverley's Jamaican English Verse', *Journal of West Indian Literature*, Vol. 18. No.1, (November 2009), pp 60 – 92

TAYLOR. ARCHIE, 'The Wisdom of Many and the Wit of One', *The Wisdom of Many, Essays on the Proverb*, edited by Wolfgang Mieder and Alan Dundes, (Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press, [1981] 1994), pp.3-9

Book Review

Contemporary Spanish Gothic

By Ann Davies

Edinburgh, Scotland: Edinburgh University Press, 2016

Reviewed by Kelly Gardner

University of Stirling, kelly.gardner@stir.ac.uk

Professor Ann Davies is currently the Chair of Spanish and Latin American Studies at the University of Stirling. Having widely published on contemporary Spanish cinema, Davies extends her extensive knowledge of Spanish narratives to delve into the core of contemporary Spanish Gothic.

In the introduction to *Globalgothic*, Glennis Byron presents the reader with a collection of chapters that intend to delve into the conditions that gave rise to the recent plethora of cultural and location-specific Gothic studies. Long considered the birthplace of Gothic, Great Britain has seen the Gothic gaze expand to consider the growing popularity of research focusing on regional and national gothics. Growing interest in Tropical Gothic, Asian Gothic, African Gothic, Kiwi Gothic, to name a few, led Byron to question the conditions and implications of this proliferation of Gothics. In short, the collection identifies globalisation as the root of proliferation, noting, 'these developments in the increasingly diverse and problematic genre labelled Gothic were intricately connected to historically specific conditions, to the development of an increasingly integrated global economy.'[50]

---

50 Glennis Byron,. "Introduction." Globalgothic. Manchester: Manchester UP, 2013. 1.

This review, however, is not of *Globalgothic*, but rather of *Contemporary Spanish Gothic* by Ann Davies, a genre labelled Gothic resource that sets out to question Byron's classification of said national Gothic labelling as problematic. In *Globalgothic* we read:

> While globalization discourse may call upon familiar gothic tropes, globalization is nevertheless transforming and defamiliarising these tropes as the increased mobility and fluidity of culture leads to the emergence of new gothic forms.[51]

Written retrospectively, *Contemporary Spanish Gothic* challenges this premise by considering the Gothic that emerges from Spain on its own merits, translating, if you will, the specifics of Spanish Gothic and its contribution to the greater Gothic community.

Davies begins with a thorough introduction of the themes and intentions that unfold in the following chapters. A chapter in its own right, the introduction serves as the foundation upon which Davies builds her argument for acknowledging the uniquely specific characteristics of her Spanish subjects and the contributions they make to the Gothic oeuvre. Here, Davies defends each of the chapters from the totalising concept of Globalgothic, by focusing on intrinsically Spanish aspects that have, themselves, influenced the development of the Gothic genre. Davies mentions Spain's contribution to the macabre conclusion of Don Juan, stating: 'Don Juan dragged to Hell by a statue of a man he murdered – that both predates and prefigures the rise of the Gothic elsewhere.' [52] Recognising the improbability of Gothic, as we know it today, having a singular source, namely that of the strand birthed from Horace Walpole's *The Castle of Otranto* (1764).

Following this expansive introduction, Davies turns her attention to 'Heritage Gothic: Goya Biopics'. Goya, Davies notes, serves as arguably the 'most notable contributor to a Gothic sensibility'.[53] In this chapter Davies examines Francisco de Goya as a Gothic classic by considering three biopics of the artist, which are: *Goya en Burdeos* (Goya in Bordeaux, Carlos Saura, 1999), *Volavérunt* (Bigas Luna, 1999) and *Goya's Ghosts* (Miloš Forman, 2006). Themes explored include Gothic spectacle and aesthetic over narrative, Gothic fakery and questionable sexual identity.

Chapter three, 'The Gothic Bestseller: The Circulation of Excess', turns away from film to consider the commercial circulation of the Gothic by looking at the work of Arturo Pérez-Reverte and Carlos Ruiz Zafón, two of Spain's bestselling authors. The main texts examined here are Pérez-Reverte's *El Club Dumas* (The Dumas Club), adapted, though not faithfully, by Roman Polanski into the film *The Ninth Gate* (1999),

---

51 Glennis Byron,. "Introduction." Globalgothic. Manchester: Manchester UP, 2013. 3.

52 Ann Davies,. "Introduction." Contemporary Spanish Gothic, Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2016. 2

53 Ann Davies,. "Introduction." Contemporary Spanish Gothic, Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2016. 3

and Zafón's *La Sombra del Viento* (The Shadow of the Wind). This persuasive chapter returns to the classic Gothic tropes of forgery and authenticity in its consideration of a Spanish imagining of Gothic mimicry. Davies notes: 'The materiality of the manuscript, while unreliable, nonetheless suggests a desire for the tangible artefact that implicitly questions the fear of ephemeral circulation posited by some critics'.[54] These Spanish examples, while rich in their own heritage, also form a visible connection to the greater theme of forgery and fakery that constantly resurface in the greater Gothic imagination.

Chapters four and five seem to address the most interesting aspect of Davies's argument against that set out by Byron's *Globalgothic*: the question of what makes Gothic specifically Spanish and how Spanish Gothic can then go on to infiltrate the wider Gothic market, more specifically the Hollywood aesthetic, in what Davies considers an 'apparently seamless trajectory'.[55] While chapter four, 'The Gothic House: Problematising the National Space' looks at the Spanish interpretation of the haunted house, it is Chapter five, 'The Gothic Camera: Javier Aguirresarobe at Home and in Hollywood' and its specific focus on the film work of Aguirresarobe that I feel could potentially attract the most attention of critics. Davies is also obviously aware of this potential, indicated by (what I consider to be) an unnecessary, in-depth justification of questionable primary sources. The first being the inclusion of the English film, though Spanish directed, *The Others* (2001), and then, more specifically, the film adaptation of Stephenie Meyer's *The Twilight Saga: New Moon* (Chris Weitz, 2009). Here, Davies seems to suggest that Aguirresarobe's Basque background informs the specifically Gothic aesthetic exhibited in his role as Spain's leading director of photography, and his foray into Hollywood has not forced him to relinquish said Gothic aesthetic, but rather allowed it to flourish in a way that, Davies suggests, counters the loss of authority, and thus meaning, so often discussed when considering the globalisation of the Gothic. What we find instead is that Spanish Gothic, more particularly Basque Gothic, pervades the films of other nations, incorporating an intertextuality that defies the watering-down implied by the concept of *Globalgothic*.

While chapter five focuses on the effect and influence of Spanish Gothic on Hollywood, the final chapter, 'Gothic Medicine: Written on the Body', turns its focus inwards, choosing to examine indigenisation in favour of deterritorialisation of the Gothic. Here, Davies notes the theme to be of 'Gothic medicine and its simultaneous recognition and attempted repression of the problematic, diseased, disruptive or dead body'[56]. This chapter considers three examples of Spanish Body Gothic, Pedro Almodóvar's *La piel que habito* (The Skin I Live In, 2011), Los *ojos de Julia* (Julia's Eyes, Guillem Morales 2010) and *El cuerpo* (The Body, Oriol Paulo 2012). With this chapter we see the Spanish manifestation of the mad scientist, the macabre surgeon, and the limits of identity and physical form. It is interesting to note, though, that Davies does not entirely escape the globalization of the Gothic, recognizing herself that *La piel que habito* is the film

---

54 Ann Davies,. "Introduction." Contemporary Spanish Gothic, Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2016. 23

55 Ann Davies,. "Introduction." Contemporary Spanish Gothic, Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2016. 23

56 Ann Davies,. "Introduction." Contemporary Spanish Gothic, Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 2016. 24

adaptation of Thierry Jonquet's French novel *Mygale* (1984). However, the specific Spanish nuances are explored in a convincing manner that justifies the significance of Spanish Gothic as unique from its regional cousins.

The strength of this book can be found in the quality of subjects considered. Each chapter presents the reader with examples that pique interest and encourage further research into the richness of Spanish Gothic. The varied chapters offer different approaches to the techniques explored within Spanish Gothic and Davies successfully collates contemporary manifestation of Spanish Gothic that deny being mere imitations. This book would be a valuable addition to any Gothic scholar's library. Davies succeeds in delivering a text that not only acknowledges and celebrates the contributions Spain has made to the Gothic on a national level, but how this has fed into and influenced Gothic on a Global scale.